

AUGUSTAN POETRY AND THE LIFE OF LUXURY

By JASPER GRIFFIN

The object of this paper is a reconsideration of the relationship in the Augustan poets between experience and convention, between individual life and inherited forms of expression. The problem, which haunts the Sonnets of Shakespeare and the poems of the Romantics no less than Horace and Propertius, has notoriously been answered in very different ways at different times. Scholars like Zielinski¹ and Wili,² for example, created romantic stories about Lydia and Cinara, and worked out Horace's feelings for them, the chronology of the affairs, and the way it all ended. In revulsion from these excesses, some influential modern writers go to an opposite extreme; they distinguish on the one hand 'Greek' or 'Hellenistic' elements, which are 'unreal' or 'imaginary', from 'Roman' ones which are 'real'. Thus, to give a few examples at once, Professor G. Williams, in his important book, writes that 'Horace's erotic poems are set in a world totally removed from the Augustan State',³ while Professor Nisbet and Miss Hubbard, in their indispensable *Commentary*, say 'The "love interest" of Horace's *Odes* is almost entirely Hellenistic',⁴ and, of *Odes* I. 5, 'Pyrrha herself is the wayward beauty of fiction, totally unlike the compliant *scorta* of Horace's own temporary affairs'.⁵ The argument here will be that this view is over-schematic and makes a distinction false, in this form, to the poets and to their society. It will, I think, prove possible to argue the point without falling into sentimentality or self-indulgence. The aim is not to reconstruct the *vie passionelle* of the poet, but to discover the setting and the tone in which he means his poems to be read. We must decide what a poem is supposed to be, or to do, in order to judge it and to respond to it; we shall here be concerned chiefly with love-poems, but other related questions arise and are important: for example, were the poets really under pressure to write encomiastic epic on the *res gestae* of Augustus, or was this merely a poetic convention?⁶ Was the relationship of Horace and Maecenas one of affection, or of interest merely?⁷ Are homosexual poems of a different order of unreality from heterosexual ones?⁸ It is impossible to maintain an attitude of suave agnosticism to all these questions, without abandoning altogether the attempt to come to grips with the poems. It also seems highly likely that our answers to them will tend not to be unrelated, but that the same general attitude of credulity or scepticism towards poetic claims will characterize all the particular views we find convincing.⁹

¹ Th. Zielinski, *Horace et la société romaine du temps d'Auguste* (1938), 169 ff.

² W. Wili, *Horaz und die aug. Kultur* (1948), 184 ff., 191.

³ G. Williams, *Tradition and Originality in Roman Poetry* (1968), 557.

⁴ R. G. M. Nisbet and M. E. Hubbard, *Commentary on Horace, Odes Book I* (1970), xiv.

⁵ *ibid.* 73.

⁶ Thus Williams, *loc. cit.*, 102: 'A more reasonable explanation of the *recusatio*-poems is, not that Maecenas and Augustus kept nagging at leading poets to write epic', but that this was 'an invention', and that the poets chose the Callimachean form 'to make political statements in verse'. It is clear that we must be very careful as to whose conception of 'reasonableness' is being applied. Ockham's razor may shave the flowing locks of a poet too short. Cf. also n. 223.

⁷ Contrast Williams, *op. cit.* 44, who believes in a real friendship: 'The historical evidence of that friendship is sufficient to make its insertion in the picture obligatory,' with Nisbet and Hubbard, *op. cit.* xxi: 'scholars tend to take too literally Horace's courteous protests (sic) of affection. One cannot detect in the relationship any of the equality required by essayists on *amicitia*.' The implication, that 'essayists on *amicitia*' are better evidence, in an individual case, than Horace's poems or Maecenas'

will ('Horatii Flacci ut mei memor esto'), is a striking one.

⁸ e.g. Nisbet and Hubbard, *op. cit.* 71 (on *Odes* I. 4): 'The homosexual implication has no bearing on Sestius' actual behaviour but is a conventional motif derived from Greek erotic poetry.' Cf. G. Williams in *JRS* 52 (1962), 39; *Tradition and Originality*, 556.

⁹ This paper will have little to say about another influential view: that forcibly expressed by F. Cairns in his very interesting book *Generic Composition in Greek and Roman Poetry* (1972). The argument of this work is that 'the whole of classical poetry is written in accordance with the sets of rules of the various genres' (31), and that 'a writer working in accordance with genre patterns . . . cannot, for instance, draw his inspiration directly from individual incidents and experiences in his own life' (98). Here it must suffice to say that the first of these assertions seems a great exaggeration, as is suggested by the facts that Cairns has himself to invent and name many of the genres he finds, and that some poems prove recalcitrant to his treatment; and that the second follows from it only if 'directly' is interpreted to mean 'absolutely immediately'. And probably very little poetry, in any language, has borne *that* relation to individual experience. An exaggerated use of this method of 'generic studies' drives too great a gap between poetry and life, of a sort akin to that here criticized. Cf. also nn. 181 and 316 below.

That 'Greek' is tantamount to 'literary', and 'literary' to 'unreal', is something of a leitmotif in this criticism. For example: 'A charming blend of the Greek and the Roman, the fanciful and the actual, is a characteristic feature of Horace's *Odes*';¹⁰ 'We must not think of Tyndaris as an actual person . . . rather, she is a dream figure, belonging to the world of Alexandrian pastoral.'¹¹ Sometimes one feels it is carried to an almost fanatical extreme: 'Violent quarrels of jealous lovers are a motif of New Comedy',¹² or 'A realistic picture, eminently suggestive of the comedy',¹³ or even 'The poet adopts the time-honoured custom (Tibull. III. 6. 2, Prop. III. 17. 1, Horace, *Epode* XI, Ovid, *Rem. Am.* 805, *Heroides* XVI. 231, *Anth. Pal.* XII. 49, Alciphron I. 35, etc.) of drowning his troubles in drink',¹⁴

The procedure here adopted in opposition to this view is as follows. First, evidence is summarily assembled to show that Roman life, and particularly the life of luxury and pleasure, was so strongly Hellenistic in colouring and material that no simple division into 'Greek' and 'Roman' elements is possible. This necessarily involves reviewing a body of factual evidence, not indeed new,¹⁵ but apparently not sufficiently brought into relation with contemporary poetry. Secondly, it will be argued that another and related distinction is also, in any simple form, unsound: that between 'literature' and 'life'. For not only does literature reflect, at whatever remove and with whatever stylization, the experiences of life, but also in its turn it affects actual behaviour; and can do so with great force. The existence of a given pattern of conduct influences the conception which people have of the ways in which it is possible to behave or to live. If this were not so, the existence of fashions in these matters would be inexplicable; that, for example, Europe in 1800 was full of Young Werthers, in 1825 of Byrons; while in 1860 virtuous youths and maidens had returned to the forefront of the stage.¹⁶ That 'few people would fall in love if they had not read about it' is an epigram which combines truth and falsehood; but it certainly seems true that the manner of experiencing and expressing the passion varies widely from period to period, and from group to group within a period.

The general influence of a milieu as a whole is clear enough, but it is also certain that particular individuals and particular books can have a mighty impact on the way others feel and live. No long residence in a University town is necessary to verify this for oneself, but a few examples from literature may be suggestive. Thus, when Stendhal entered Italy for the first time, he records: 'I said to myself: I am in Italy, in the country of *Zulietta* whom J.-J. Rousseau met in Venice, and in Piedmont, the country of Mme. Bazile . . .'¹⁷ It is no surprise that as soon as he reaches Milan he is caught up in a passionate love affair. A writer on Stendhal's life observes that in attempting the seduction of Melanie Guilbert 'he can never forget the example of Laclos' Valmont'¹⁸ (the hero of *Les Liaisons Dangereuses*). Delacroix, to maintain a high level of romantic fervour, reminds himself of passages from Byron.¹⁹ The young Baudelaire 'read with feverish interest Sainte Beuve's one novel, *Volupté*, published in 1834, and this . . . helped to crystallize what had hitherto been vague and undefined in him and scarcely admitted even to himself'.²⁰ Later

¹⁰ Nisbet and Hubbard, op. cit. (n. 4), 109.

¹¹ *ibid.* 216.

¹² *ibid.* 226.

¹³ K. F. Smith on Tibullus I. 2. 93-7.

¹⁴ *idem* on Tibullus I. 2. 1-6.

¹⁵ See Nisbet and Hubbard, xv: 'These of course were Roman institutions as well, but their repeated mention in such poems owes much to the convention of the genre'.

¹⁶ See for example B. Snell in *Gnomon* 19 (1943), 71: as Germany in 1800 was 'voll von lauter Werthern', so we know from Aristophanes that young contemporaries emulated Euripidean characters: 'so sehr war und ist die Selbstinterpretation der Menschen und damit ihr Handeln und ihr Charakter abhängig von vorgebildeten Gestalten'. Also P. Boyancé and J. Bayet in *Entretiens Hardt* II (1956), 41 f.

¹⁷ *Vie de Henry Brulard* (Paris, edn. Le Divan 1949), 483. Of his love, Stendhal writes: 'La femme que j'aimais, et dont je me croyais en quelque sorte aimé, avait d'autres amants, mais elle me préférait à rang égal, me disais-je! J'avais d'autres maîtresses...' It could be Propertius speaking.

¹⁸ W. H. Fineshreiber jr., *Stendhal the Romantic Rationalist* (1932), 27.

¹⁹ E. Delacroix, *Journals* for 11 May 1824: 'Rappelle, pour t'enflammer éternellement, certains passages de Byron; ils me vont bien.' In his *Correspondance générale* I, 85 (of 20 October 1818) we find him writing of the imitation of Rousseau by some of his friends: 'Ensuite un ami qui écrivait la tête dans ses mains, non pas pour rendre les élans de son cœur, mais pour les rendre d'une certaine manière et pour faire du Rousseau...'

²⁰ E. Starkie, *Baudelaire* (1957), 47.

Baudelaire wrote a poem about it, in which he tells Sainte Beuve that, reading the book when already

mûri par vos sonnets, préparé par vos stances,
he took it into himself:

J'en ai tout absorbé, les miasmes, les parfums,
Le doux chuchotement des souvenirs défunts,
Les longs enlacements des phrases symboliques . . .
Livre voluptueux, si jamais il en fut . . .²¹

On a larger scale, the Latin Quarter was popularized by Henry Murger. His book *La Vie de Bohème* was published in 1851; by 1855, as a result of its success, there was an American restaurant in the Quarter, and in the same year James Whistler, aged twenty-one, threw up his government job in Washington and went to live there and be an artist.²² Such things, I think, help to confirm that these 'literary' influences can be vital; what might be written off as 'literature' is inextricable from 'life'.

In a second article I plan to concentrate upon a particular type of historical figure, on the reciprocal relation of such men with scandal and propaganda, and on the existence in Roman life of conspicuous figures who were believed to live a life strikingly similar to that claimed as their own by the love poets. It will be suggested there that the importance of all this has been greatly underestimated, and in particular that the life of Mark Antony, as presented in literature, shows one of the most spectacular men in the world living a life which could be depicted, without absurdity, as in important respects akin to that lived in 'literature' by Propertius.

In the context of Latin literature, discussion of Greek influence on Rome tends to be over-weighted towards the intellectual side. For men like Horace and Propertius it was of course important that the Rome they lived in was now full of Greek intellectuals²³—poets,²⁴ scholars,²⁵ philosophers,²⁶ doctors,²⁷ scientists,²⁸ astrologers²⁹—and was now even acquiring, on the Alexandrian model, her first public Library.³⁰ But the Hellenistic refinements which went to make up the life of pleasure were no doubt even more significant, and some of the evidence for this will now be set out. As a preliminary remark it may be said that such a life was evidently felt by Romans, including the poets, as being a definite and recognizable unity, which a man might choose and live, or live part of the time, in preference to other ways of life. Cicero refers to the *delicata iuventus* almost as if it constituted a

²¹ Baudelaire: *A Sainte-Beuve*.

²² e.g. A Moss and E. Marvel, *The Legend of the Latin Quarter* (1964), 142. A further twist is added by the fact that Du Maurier later included a character, recognizably Whistler, as 'Joe Sibley' in the first version of *Trilby*, his novel describing artistic life in Paris; the publishers were made to apologize, and the offending chapters were omitted. The combination of biography and literature in all this is indissoluble. Murger's novel was a romanticized version of his own life . . .

²³ Listed by A. Hillscher, 'Hominum literatorum Graecorum ante Tiberii mortem in urbe Roma commoratorum historia critica,' *Jahrb. für klass. Phil., Suppl.* 18 (1892), 335–40. See also G. W. Bowersock, *Augustus and the Greek World* (1965); R. Heinze, *Die august. Kultur* (1930), 65–76. For example, the historians Diodorus of Sicily, Dionysius of Halicarnassus, Nicolaus of Damascus, Strabo and Timagenes all visited Rome and worked there.

²⁴ After Parthenius of Nicaea, whose importance is rightly stressed by W. V. Clausen, 'Callimachus and Roman Poetry', *GRBSt.* 5 (1964), 181–96, for example Antipater of Thessalonice and Crinagoras of Mitylene, who lived in the Imperial household.

²⁵ Strabo 675, Rome is *Ἰερὸν καὶ Ἀλεξανδρῶν φιλολόγων μεστὴ*. Cf. P. M. Fraser, *Ptolemaic Alexandria* (1972) I, 474.

²⁶ e.g. Athenodorus the Stoic, influential with Augustus (Strabo 674; see also P. Grimal in *REA* 47 (1945), 261; *ibid.* 48 (1946), 62); and Areius Didymus, whose *consolatio* to Livia is quoted by Seneca, *ad Marciam* 4. 5. Augustus' literary output included *hortationes ad philosophiam* (Suet., *D. Aug.* 85).

²⁷ C. Allbutt, *Greek Medicine in Rome* (1921); J. Scarborough, *Roman Medicine* (1969), 110 ff. on the prevalence of Greek doctors in upper-class households.

²⁸ Fraser, *op. cit.* (n. 24), 425: 'The migratory movement of Alexandrian scientists and grammarians to Rome, so noticeable in the fields of grammar, medicine, and philosophy . . .'

²⁹ A. Bouché-Leclercq, *L'Astrologie grecque*, ch. xvi; F. A. Cramer, *Astrology in Roman Law and Politics*, *Mem. Amer. Philos. Soc.* 37 (1954). Cramer remarks, p. 88, on the 'astounding familiarity with astrology among his readers' assumed by Propertius IV. 1. I should not share the confidence of some scholars (*Critical Essays on Roman Literature: Elegy and Lyric*, ed. J. P. Sullivan (1962), 191), that the astrologically inclined Leuconoe of Hor. C. 1. 11 is 'an imaginary person with a Greek name'.

³⁰ Suet., *D. Aug.* 29. It is striking how little the poets have to say about the Library.

political party,³¹ and both he and Sallust³² talk of such people as numerous and clearly identifiable. The life we glimpse in the poems of Lucilius, and again in those of Catullus and his contemporaries,³³ has precisely this character: a life of *amours*, parties, drinking, jealousy, and (for some) poetry and music. And this is the life, one of *inertia* and *nequitia*, which the Augustan elegists proclaim as their own.³⁴ And of course from an early date such a life was felt to be Greek: the meaning of *congraeicare* and *pergraeicari* in Plautus³⁵ is unambiguous, and Festus says, flatly, 'pergraeicari est epulis et potationibus inservire'.

First, the city itself. Its layout,³⁶ its aqueducts,³⁷ its basilicas³⁸ for comfortable lounging, its public baths³⁹ for leisure, the works of art on show,⁴⁰ the marble buildings of which Augustus boasted⁴¹—all this was unthinkable without Eastern influence.⁴² Franz Cumont sums up by saying, in connection with the attempts of 29 and 18 B.C. (inevitably unsuccessful) to exclude from Rome the cult of Isis: 'Le prestige d'Alexandrie n'était-il pas invincible? Elle est alors plus belle, plus savante, mieux policée que Rome; elle offrait le modèle de la capitale accomplie, jusqu'où les Latins cherchaient à se hausser. Ils traduisaient ses érudits, imitaient ses littérateurs, appelaient ses artistes, claquaient ses institutions. Comment sa religion ne leur aurait-elle pas fait subir son ascendant?'⁴³

Outside Rome, the same is true of the villas beloved by the upper class. Both of the two types are influenced by Greek models,⁴⁴ and they are well called 'real centres of Hellenistic luxury'.⁴⁵ We have only to look at the importance of these villas in the letters of Cicero to see how significant this is. And we observe that all this is true of literature as of life: C. C. Van Essen shows that the palaces in the *Aeneid* are akin above all with the buildings of the Greek city of Naples.⁴⁶ It is not surprising that hunting was a Hellenistic importation to Rome;⁴⁷ more striking is it that the same is true, despite the more hospitable Italian setting, of the art of the garden.⁴⁸ Even the luxury fish-ponds, which became such a

³¹ W. Kroll, *Kultur der ciceronischen Zeit* (1933, repr. 1966), 160 ff.; Cic., *ad Att.* I. 19. 8: 'odia autem illa libidinosae et delicatae iuventutis quae erat in me incitata sic mitigata sunt comitate quadam mea, me unum ut omnes colant' (a typical piece of optimism from 60 B.C.); cf. *Cat.* II. 23: 'in his gregibus omnes aleatores, omnes impuri impudicique versantur. hi pueri tam lepidi ac delicati non solum amare et amari neque saltare et cantare, sed etiam sicas vibrare didicerunt . . .' In *de Off.* I. 106, he contrasts two ways of life: one is to live 'parce, continenter, severe, sobrie'; the other, 'diffluere luxuria et delicate ac molliter vivere'. The contrast is already a stock one by Terence's time, cf. *Adelphoe* 863 ff., Donatus on *Adelphoe* 9. In Lucilius, e.g. 1058 M: 'imberbi androgyni, barbari moechocinaedi', rightly explained by Housman, *CQ* I (1907), 156 = *Collected Papers* II. 693, as 'dissolute young men of fashion'.

³² Sallust, *Cat.* 10-17, 23, 25, etc. Cicero presents such a way of life from a hostile stand-point in the *Philippics*, and from an apologetic one in the *pro Caelio*, a speech exploited in this connection by A. Guillemin, 'L'élément humain dans l'épigramme latine', *REL* 18 (1940), 95 ff. The standard elements are listed, in connection with Hannibal in Capua, by Livy XXIII. 18. 12: 'somnia et vinum et epulae et scorta balinaeque et otium.'

³³ On it, see J. Bayet in *Entretiens Hardt* II (1956), 4 ff.

³⁴ cf. p. 98 below.

³⁵ e.g. *Mostellaria* 22: 'dies noctesque bibite, pergraeicamini, | amicas emite liberate, pascite | parasitos, obsonate pollucibiliter'.

³⁶ M. W. Frederiksen in *The Romans*, ed. J. P. V. D. Balsdon (1965), 160, of the schematic layout of Roman towns: 'Most likely the idea came from the Greeks.' Architects still came regularly from the East to Rome in the time of Trajan: Pliny, *Ep.* x. 40.

³⁷ 'As for the aqueducts, the idea of course was Greek', A. Boethius, *The Golden House of Nero* (1960), 77. He emphasizes (p. 30) that once Roman

soldiers had seen the Greek cities of the East, they had to be given similar luxuries in the Western military colonies.

³⁸ Named after the *στοὰ βασιλική* of the Hellenistic city. All four sides of the Forum had been provided with this convenience by 169 B.C. They were good places for picking up girls, in literature (*Prop.* II. 32. 11, Ovid, *Ars* I. 67, 492 etc.), and doubtless in life too. So were the theatres: Ovid, *Ars* I. 100: 'ille locus casti damna pudoris habet'; *Amores* II. 2. 26 ff.

³⁹ The first big ones were built by Agrippa: R. Heinze, *Die aug. Kultur*, 69, 'Die ersten Roms, dessen Bewohner sich bis dahin schämen mussten, wenn sie in den Grossstädten des Osten überall die herrlichsten Badeanlagen sahen . . .'

⁴⁰ e.g. in the Porticus Metelli famous Hellenistic statues; Ovid, *Ars* I. 70 ff., the Porticus Octavia is 'externo marmore dives opus', and the Porticus Liviae is 'priscis sparsa tabellis'.

⁴¹ Suet., *D. Aug.* 28.

⁴² 'As regards comfort, beauty, and hygiene, the cities of the Roman Empire, worthy successors to their Hellenistic parents . . .', Rostovtzeff, *SEHRE*², 143.

⁴³ F. Cumont, *Les religions orientales dans le paganisme romain*⁴ (1929), 78. The ladies of elegy incline to the cult of Isis, e.g. *Prop.* II. 33; *Tibull.* I. 3. 23; Ovid, *Am.* I. 8. 74.

⁴⁴ A. G. McKay, *Houses, Villas and Palaces in the Roman World* (1975), 114 ff.

⁴⁵ Boethius, op. cit. (n. 36), 96: 'The villa acquired more and more luxurious features, many of them borrowed from Greece'; J. P. V. D. Balsdon, *Life and Leisure in Ancient Rome* (1969), 206.

⁴⁶ 'L'architecture dans l'Énéide', *Mnem.* 7 (1939), 225-36.

⁴⁷ J. Aymard, *Essai sur les chasses romaines* (1951), ch. 2.

⁴⁸ P. Grimal, *Les jardins romains*² (1969), 69: 'Sans l'influence grecque, jamais un art des jardins digne de ce nom ne serait né à Rome'.

symbol for Rome of plutocratic inertia, were a Roman adaptation of a diversion first indulged in by Hellenistic kings.⁴⁹

Italy, and above all Rome, was full of Greek works of art, both sculptures and paintings. It was as loot that the visual arts made their entry to Rome chained to the chariots of triumphant generals,⁵⁰ but such was their vogue that by the end of the Republic some Romans were prepared to pay for works of art.⁵¹ Moralists loved to dwell on their demoralizing effect. Thus Livy laments, of Marcellus' triumph over Syracuse in 211: 'inde primum (*sic*) initium mirandi Graecarum artium opera licentiaeque huic sacra profanaque omnia volgo spoliandi factum est'.⁵² Of Vulso's triumph over Asia in 187, he laments: 'luxuria peregrinae origo (*sic*) ab exercitu Asiatico invecna in urbem est'.⁵³ With art goes *luxuria*: Polybius says that the triumph of Aemilius Paullus in 168 turned young men's minds to ἐρώμενοι, ἑταῖροι, ἀκροάματα and πότοι.⁵⁴ As late as 58 B.C. Roman innocence was still being debauched by the East; Pliny laments, of the notorious aedileship of M. Scaurus: 'cuius nescio an aedilitas maxime prostraverit mores'.⁵⁵

The importance of this for our purpose is the significance which works of art had for Augustan poets, especially Propertius.⁵⁶ It is also highly suggestive that such works were, in principle, regarded as corrupting and un-Roman; for the whole *vita* of love and pleasure extolled by Propertius had the same character. It is worth remembering that Greek art had for a young Roman a resonance far more exciting than a visit to the National Gallery or the British Museum for us.⁵⁷ An aesthete lived amid images derived from Greece and its mythology, of which he was sharply conscious that they were Greek, and that many sturdy Romans disliked and disapproved of them.⁵⁸

Greece itself was of course where the Roman tourist, student, and émigré naturally went. To visit mainland Greece was part of the education of the Roman of good family, and of those who, like the young Horace,⁵⁹ emulated their betters. As early as 190 B.C. a hotel for Roman citizens existed at Delphi,⁶⁰ and in the second century B.C. Romans made very much the same tour of Greece as Hellenophiles today.⁶¹ Eminent exiles⁶² and émigrés⁶³ were numerous enough to make Caesar limit residence abroad to three successive years;⁶⁴ no doubt to little effect. In life, Agrippa withdrew to Lesbos⁶⁵ and Tiberius to Rhodes;⁶⁶ in literature, Horace's friend Bullatius is begged to come home from the charms of the

⁴⁹ J. H. D'Arms, *Romans on the Bay of Naples* (1970), 41; *RE* s.v. 'Piscina', 1783. On the *piscinarii* of the late Republic, R. Syme, *The Roman Revolution* (1939), 23. *Ibid.* 410, Vedius Pollio: the type did not die with the Republic.

⁵⁰ 'Die bildenden Künste hatten ihren Einzug in Rom an die Viergespanne der Triumphatoren gefesselt gemacht,' G. A. Saalfeld, *Der Hellenismus in Latium* (1882), 105. Even new trees were led in triumph, Pliny, *NH* XII. 111: 'clarumque dictu, a Pompeio Magno in triumpho arbores quoque duximus'. The sources on the visual arts at Rome are collected by O. Vessberg, *Studien zur Kunstgeschichte der röm. Republik* (1941). See also H. Jucker, *Vom Verhältnis der Römer zur bildenden Kunst der Griechen* (1950).

⁵¹ Vessberg gives the evidence for the looting of Syracuse, 211 B.C.; Capua, 210; Tarentum, 209; Eretria, 198; Macedon, 194; Aetolia and Ambracia, 187; Asia, 186; Macedon again, 168; Carthage and Corinth, 146; Athens, 88; etc. Sulla removed everything from Olympia as well as from Delphi, Epidaurus and Athens. Lucullus, after his rich triumph over Mithridates, incurred 'great expenses' (Plut., *Luc.* 39) in collecting Greek art. Other collections, such as that of Verres, continued to be formed on the older, cheaper method.

⁵² Livy xxv. 40. 1.

⁵³ Livy xxxix. 6. 7-9. A cool view of this assertion: A. W. Lintott in *Historia* 21 (1972), 626-38.

⁵⁴ Polybius xxxi. 25. 4-8.

⁵⁵ Pliny, *NH* xxxvi. 113. Cicero loves to make the association: *Pro Flacco* 71: 'Graecorum luxuria'; *Pro Murena* 12: 'habet Asia suspicionem luxuriae quandam'; *Pro Flacco* 5: 'Asiae luxuries'; *Verr.*

II. 7.

⁵⁶ e.g. J.-P. Boucher, *Études sur Properce* (1965), 41 ff.; H. Bartholomé, *Ovid und die antike Kunst* (1935); Rothstein's edition of Propertius, index, s.v. 'Kunst, bildende'.

⁵⁷ Propertius has an elegant variation on the motif of 'corrupting works of art' at II. 6. 27 ff.: *obscene pictures corrupt girls*.

⁵⁸ It is plausibly argued that even the realistic portrait statues of Rome were actually made by Greeks: so e.g. G. M. A. Richter, 'Who made the Roman Portrait Statues—Greeks or Romans?', in *TAPhA* 95 (1951), 183 ff.

⁵⁹ V. Pöschl points out, *Entretiens Hardt* II (1956), 95 that in Greece Horace will have heard real Greeks singing. That has its implications for his lyric poetry.

⁶⁰ *Syll.*³ II, 609.

⁶¹ e.g. Livy xxxvii. 54. 20; XLV. 27; Polyb. xxx. 10. 3-6.

⁶² As P. Rutilius Rufus, in exile at Mitylene and Smyrna (Cic., *Rab. Post.* 27). Milo went to Massilia: on the refinements of that city, and its popularity with Roman grandees, Strabo 181.

⁶³ Like T. Pomponius Atticus.

⁶⁴ Suet., *D. Jul.* 42.

⁶⁵ Suet., *D. Aug.* 66.

⁶⁶ Suet., *Tib.* 11-13. He apparently led a Greek life there: II. 1. . . 'sine lictore aut viatore gymnasio interdum obambulans mutuaque cum Graeculis officia usurpans prope ex aequo'; 13. 1. . . 'redegitque se deposito patrio habitu ad pallium et crepidas'; II. 3: 'cum circa scholas et auditoria professorum assiduus esset. . .'

East,⁶⁷ and Propertius' friend Tullus is urged to come home from Cyzicus.⁶⁸ In Italy itself, 'it was fashionable to spend time in the remaining Greek cities of Italy.'⁶⁹ The terrible Sulla appeared in the Greek *chlamys* at Naples,⁷⁰ and its elegance and the freedom it allowed drew to the city many noble youths and senators.⁷¹ Horace speaks of 'otiosa Neapolis';⁷² Virgil says he composed the *Georgics* there, 'flourishing in the studies of ignoble leisure.'⁷³ The bay of Naples altogether was a popular resort. Baiae was redolent of the franker pleasures,⁷⁴ but literary men and philosophers could also be found by those with a taste for them.⁷⁵ Augustus, who bought Capri in 29 B.C., spent his last days of life at Naples, where he witnessed the Σεβαστά, the Greek games in his honour,⁷⁶ and told Romans to wear the Greek dress and speak Greek, Greeks to wear the toga and speak Latin. Tarentum, on the other coast, was in Cicero's view the perfect place for the Epicurean;⁷⁷ Virgil set his ideal *Corycius senex* near Tarentum,⁷⁸ which is where Propertius envisages the setting of the *Eclogues*;⁷⁹ Horace was moved to wish that he might die there.⁸⁰

The more hedonistic is the aspect of life to which we turn, the more Greek it seems to be. Wine, which figures so largely in the poets, was raised to an art in Greece. Pliny the Elder tells us that 'until our grand-fathers' time' (sc. the Augustan age) Greek wines were preferred at Rome.⁸¹ The frugal Cato gave recipes for making your own *vinum Graecum* and *vinum Coum*;⁸² Italian wines began to be marked with the vintage in 121 B.C.,⁸³ and it seems that pressure from Greek wines had raised the standard of the local product. But the imported wines still commanded such high prices that the censors of 89 B.C. stepped in to regulate them. We know the authors of five Hellenistic treatises on viticulture,⁸⁴ and no doubt here as in agriculture⁸⁵ Greek theory and skill were at work in Italy. We read of outstandingly successful growers, who achieved fabulous results in a vineyard 'in Nomentano agro' and sold it at a huge profit to Seneca the philosopher: their names were Acilius Sthenelus and Remmius Palaemon.⁸⁶

Luxury clothes tell a similar story, of the West trying to catch up with Eastern refinement and technique. The most highly prized wool, says Pliny, is that of Apulia, 'and what in Italy is called Greek, but elsewhere is called Italian'⁸⁷; Milesian wool holds third place, that of Tarentum and Canusium is very good, so is that of Laodicea. Columella, however, thinks that whereas 'our ancestors' thought the best wool was Calabrian, Apulian and Milesian, and the very best of all came from Tarentum: 'nunc Gallicae pretiosiores habentur'.⁸⁸ Gallic and Italian wool, it seems, has now caught up with Greek.⁸⁹ The more frankly luxury garments were of unambiguously Eastern origin: 'the best clothing, especially for women, seems to have been imported,'⁹⁰ and in poetry the favourite stuffs of Cynthia and her sisters were linen, silk, Tyrian purple, and the see-through *Coae vestes*.⁹¹ Caesar attempted to restrict the wearing of Tyrian garments;⁹² no doubt ineffectively. As for fashion, Greek modes made themselves felt dramatically at Rome when men began to shave, a practice deriving from Alexander; more generally, 'since the late Republic, styles both of dress and of coiffure were open to all the Greek artifices.'⁹³ The Greek words

⁶⁷ Hor., *Ep.* I. 11. 21, 'Romae laudetur Samos et Chios et Rhodos absens'.

⁶⁸ Prop. III. 22.

⁶⁹ G. W. Bowersock, *Augustus and the Greek World* (1965), 74.

⁷⁰ Cic., *Rab. Post.* 26.

⁷¹ Cic., *pro Planc.* 65; Strabo 246.

⁷² Hor., *Epode* v. 43.

⁷³ Virgil, *G.* IV. 563-4: 'illo Virgilium me tempore dulcis alebat | Parthenope, studiis florentem ignobilis oti.' The wording is a bow—not without irony—to the ultra-Roman view of such matters as poetry as a 'waste of time'.

⁷⁴ Baiae in reality: Cicero, *pro Cael.* 35; *ad Att.*, I. 16. 10; D'Arms, *Romans on the Bay of Naples*, 119 ff. Baiae in poetry: Prop. I. 11; III. 18; Hor., *C.* III. 4. 24; *Ep.* I. 1. 83; [Tibull.] III. 5. 3; Ovid, *Ars* I. 255 ff.

⁷⁵ D'Arms, op. cit. 56.

⁷⁶ Suet., *D. Aug.* 98; Vell. Pat. II. 123. 1. The games were Italica Romaea Sebasta Isolympia: Bowersock, 83.

⁷⁷ Cic., *ad Fam.* VII. 12. 1.

⁷⁸ Virgil, *G.* IV. 125 ff.

⁷⁹ Prop. II. 34. 67.

⁸⁰ Hor., *C.* II. 6 fin.

⁸¹ Pliny, *NH* XIV. 87.

⁸² Cato, *RR* 105; 112.

⁸³ Pliny, *NH* XIV. 94.

⁸⁴ Susemihl, *Geschichte der griechischen Literatur* I, 840.

⁸⁵ cf. Rostovtzeff, *SEHRE*² I, 19 on the introduction of Hellenistic methods into Italian husbandry.

⁸⁶ Pliny, *NH* XIV. 48-52.

⁸⁷ *NH* VIII. 190.

⁸⁸ *RR* VII. 2. 3.

⁸⁹ cf. Tenney Frank, *Economic Survey* V (1940), 164.

⁹⁰ *ibid.* 201, n. 42.

⁹¹ Prop. I. 2. 1-4; II. 1. 4; 16. 18; IV. 5. 22; 5. 57; Hor., *Serm.* I. 2. 101; *C.* IV. 13. 3; *Epp.* I. 12. 21; Tibull. I. 9. 67; II. 3. 53; Ov., *Ars* II. 297, etc. *Byssus* came from Cilicia, Egypt and Syria.

⁹² Suet., *D. Jul.* 43.

⁹³ Marquardt, *Röm. Privatleben*², 603.

in use in hairdressing and cosmetics show the pervasiveness of this influence.⁹⁴ All readers of the Augustan poets are struck by the attention they pay to the hair of the beloved and to its *cultus*⁹⁵; the smart lover also takes great trouble with his own hair.⁹⁶ He too must look to his *cultus*—though he should not use cosmetics nor dye his hair, as the girls do.⁹⁷

With clothes and cosmetics goes perfume. Horace refers to perfumes eight times in the *Odes*, and Propertius too loves to talk of them.⁹⁸ Perfumes, with spices and jewellery, represented conspicuous and extravagant luxury; like them, they came from the East. Plautus talks of 'unguenta exotica';⁹⁹ their importation was forbidden, predictably, in 189 B.C.¹⁰⁰ Hellenistic Queens had been among the most zealous promoters of perfumes.¹⁰¹ Pliny says, perhaps rather wildly, that the importation of pearls and *odores* from Arabia cost Rome 100,000,000 sesterces a year.¹⁰² Men, too, used perfumes discreetly;¹⁰³ it was a regular part of the convivial evening, and Catullus XIII, and Horace, *C. iv. 12* show us how highly it was rated. In the poets perfumes altogether loom much larger than the restrained taste of our own society would lead us to expect; in this they exactly reflect their own society.¹⁰⁴

Cookery was another art despised, so their descendants believed, by the good old Romans of the past. There is a pleasing contrast between Livy's complaint, in his jeremiad on the *luxuria peregrina* brought into Rome in 187 B.C., that 'coquus, vilissimum antiquis mancipium, . . . in pretio esse et quod ministerium fuerat, ars haberi coepit',¹⁰⁵ and what we read in Athenaeus on the dignity of cooking, a long diatribe with many quotations.¹⁰⁶ Among these, Heraclides and Glaucus of Rhegium said it was not right that a slave should be a cook, 'nor even a free-man, unless he is somebody special.'¹⁰⁷ In Greek, cookery books go back to the fifth century; Susemihl lists twenty-two whose names are known to us, with six specialized works on baking, and even two on the art of buying food (τέχνη ὀψωνητικῆ).¹⁰⁸ No less a person than Ennius himself based his *Hedyphagetica* upon the work of Arcestratus, whose poem on the subject, in the epic style, was known as the 'gourmet's Hesiod'.¹⁰⁹ The luxuries of the table soon engrossed much time and effort and vast expense.¹¹⁰ Cicero's *In Pisonem* gives an idea of the standard expected of a senator, with his sneers at the sordid hospitality of Piso; while his letters to Papirius Paetus give a glimpse into the gourmet dinners of his time.¹¹¹ Horace satirizes an over-elaborate meal;¹¹² it is not in the manner either of the elegists or of Horace's *Odes* to tell us about the menu at the *convivia* which occupy so much of their poetry, but we are not meant to imagine it, if we think of it at all, as having been unsophisticated.

Jewellery, too, is important. The poets have much to say of pearls, in particular,¹¹³ and the girls they write about have a sharp eye for gold. Pearls of course came from the East (Caesar tried vainly to restrict their use),¹¹⁴ and the jewellers and their styles were Greek.¹¹⁵

⁹⁴ e.g. *corymbion, galerus, galericulum, calliblepharon, psilothra*.

⁹⁵ Ovid, *Ars. III. 133-68*; Prop. I. 2. 1; I. 15. 5; Hor., *C. I. 5. 4*; *Epode XI. 28*, etc.

⁹⁶ Hor., *S. II. 7. 55*; *C. III. 19. 25*; *Epp. I. 14. 32*; Prop. II. 4. 5; Tibull. I. 8. 9; Ovid, *Ars I. 505 ff.*

⁹⁷ Prop. I. 2. 19; II. 18. 23; III. 24. 8; Tibull. I. 8. 43; Ov., *Am. I. 14* etc.

⁹⁸ e.g. Prop. II. 29. 17; III. 10. 22; Ov., *Am. III. I. 7*; *Her. xv. 76*.

⁹⁹ *Mostell. 43*; 'non omnes possunt olere unguenta exotica.'

¹⁰⁰ Pliny, *NH XIII. 24*.

¹⁰¹ For Berenice, Callimachus fr. 110; for Arsinoe and Stratonice of Pergamum, cf. Athenaeus 689a.

¹⁰² *NH XII. 84*: 'tanti nobis deliciae et feminae constant.' He lists Eastern sources of perfumes, XIII. 4-8.

¹⁰³ cf. J. Colin, 'Luxe orientale et parfums masculins dans la Rome alexandrine', *RBPPh* 33 (1955), 5-19.

¹⁰⁴ The stage was perfumed at theatrical performances, Lucret. II. 416, Brandt on Ov., *Ars. I. 104*. Trimalchio had unconventional ways of distributing perfume to his guests, Petron. 60. 3; Nero, with what seems even worse taste, could spray perfume on his from the ceilings of the *Domus Aurea* (Suet., *Nero* 31).

¹⁰⁵ Livy XXXIX. 6.

¹⁰⁶ Athenaeus 658e ff.

¹⁰⁷ Athenaeus 661e: οὐχ ἀρμόττειν φασι δούλουςι τῆν μαγειρικὴν, ἀλλ' οὐδὲ τοῖς τυχοῦσι τῶν ἐλευθέρων.

¹⁰⁸ *Geschichte der gr. Lit. I, 879*.

¹⁰⁹ Athenaeus 101 f.

¹¹⁰ Still worth reading is L. Friedländer, *Roman Life and Manners* (English translation) II, 146 ff.: 'The luxury of the table and the importation of foreign foods.'

¹¹¹ Cic., *Fam. IX. 20, 25, 26*. At the last of these Cicero found the celebrated Cytheris, see below p. 96.

¹¹² Hor., *Serm. II. 8*.

¹¹³ Prop. I. 8. 39; 14. 2; II. 16. 17; III. 4. 2; Tibull. II. 2. 15; 4. 30; III. 3. 17; Hor., *C. III. 24. 48*; Ovid, *Ars I. 251*, etc.

¹¹⁴ Suet., *D. Jul. 43*.

¹¹⁵ 'The jewellery of the early Empire may be regarded merely as a continuation of Hellenistic jewellery . . . the chief centres of production were probably in the first place the old Hellenistic centres of Alexandria and Antioch, in the second place Rome itself. The Roman craftsmen, as in the other arts and crafts, were doubtless to a large extent immigrants from the East': R. A. Higgins, *Greek and Roman Jewellery* (1961), 178, 181.

A special department is that of signet rings; this is especially important because in the late Republic and early Empire 'every Roman of any dignity must have had an individual signet ring, and men took pride in having a distinctive and artistic seal'.¹¹⁶ Pompey and Caesar were among the first Romans to collect them,¹¹⁷ and we are well informed about the seals of Maecenas (a frog),¹¹⁸ and of Augustus, who used successively a sphinx, a portrait of Alexander, and his own portrait carved by Dioscurides.¹¹⁹ It is striking that here too, for these highly personal treasures, the source was the same;¹²⁰ as it was also for the higher class at least of silver-ware for the table,¹²¹ and for the styles of house furniture in general.¹²²

The life of pleasure naturally led to the company not only of *meretrices* but also of actors and mimes. Such famous theatrical names as Aesopus, Antipho, Diphilus, Eros, Spinther, show the origin of these unrespectable people.¹²³ Sulla, a boon companion all his days, after his retirement *συνῆν μίμοις γυναιξί και κιθαριστρίαις και θυμηλικοῖς ἀνθρώποις*: 'the people of most influence with him were Roscius the comedian, Sorix the arch-mime, and Metrobius the female impersonator'.¹²⁴ Cicero professes to be outraged by the *mima uxor* of Antony and by his 'mimorum et mimarum greges'.¹²⁵ The most crudely unromantic of the *Sermones* of Horace¹²⁶ takes *mimae* for granted as part of the life of dissipation; in the more courtly ethos of the *Odes*, of course, they are not mentioned, as such at least. The most famous dancers of the time, on whom violent passions centred, were Pylades of Cilicia, Bathyllus of Alexandria, Nomius of Syria, Hylas the Carian, Pierus of Tibur—all Greek names.¹²⁷ Augustus himself, in a discreet and dignified manner, was a good friend of actors.¹²⁸

It is worth while to pause here, in order to emphasize that Maecenas himself, whose importance for the poets it is perhaps impossible to exaggerate, was notorious for his luxurious taste in every one of these areas. He was a by-word for effeminate fabrics,¹²⁹ and was teased by Augustus for his interest in jewels;¹³⁰ his house was palatial¹³¹ and his Gardens never lost their celebrity.¹³² He produced famous wine¹³³ and was notorious too for affected epicurism at table,¹³⁴ for his affairs with women,¹³⁵ and for his liaison with the actor Bathyllus.¹³⁶ We must ask ourselves what the probability is that his poets really lived a life quite different, in respects other than those caused by Maecenas' vast wealth and their comparative poverty, from that of their great patron.

Also common to life¹³⁷ and poetry¹³⁸ is gambling (*alea*), intensely popular, Greek in

¹¹⁶ Tenney Frank, *op. cit.* (n. 86), 211. Cf. H. M.-L. Vollenweider, 'Verwendung und Bedeutung der Porträtgemmen für das politische Leben der römischen Republik', *Mus. Helv.* 12 (1955), 96-111.

¹¹⁷ Pliny, *NH* xxxvii. 11-12.

¹¹⁸ *ibid.* 10.

¹¹⁹ Suet., *D. Aug.* 50.

¹²⁰ 'Most of the signatures on gems of the early Roman period are in Greek and with Greek names... their techniques, materials and subjects... remained basically Hellenistic Greek': J. Boardman, *Greek Gems and Finger Rings* (1970), 362.

¹²¹ Of the seventeen celebrated *argentarii* and *caelatores* listed by Pliny, *NH* xxxiii. 154-7, all have Greek names. Cf. Prop. I. 14. 2, 'Lesbia Mentoreo vina bibas opere.'

¹²² G. M. A. Richter, *Ancient Furniture* (1926), 117, 'there were few original contributions' (sc. from Rome). 'The pre-Hellenistic house must have been simply, even sparsely, furnished with basic articles... However, a revolution in taste and design attended the sudden entry of Rome into the main stream of Hellenistic history...', A. G. McKay, *Houses, Villas and Palaces in the Roman World* (1975), 136. The same is true of mosaics: 'Roman pavements in the first two centuries are almost entirely Hellenistic in inspiration.'

¹²³ 'Nun (sc. in the first half of the first century B.C.) begegnen wir auch unter den Schauspielern am meisten griechischen Namen,' *RE*, s.v. 'Histrio,' 2120.

¹²⁴ Plutarch, *Sulla* 36; cf. *ibid.* 2.

¹²⁵ Cicero, *Philippic* II. 20, VIII. 26, etc.

¹²⁶ Hor., *Serm.* I. 2. 2, 56, 58.

¹²⁷ *ILS* 5180-276, *tituli pertinentes ad ludos*, is rich in Greek names.

¹²⁸ Suet., *D. Aug.* 45 and 74. Already for Lucilius *cinaedi* and dancers are proverbial; fr. 32 M. 'stulte saltatum te inter venisse cinaedos'; and the boast of Periplectomenus at Plaut., *Miles* 668, 'tum ad saltandum non cinaedus malacus aequat atque ego.'

¹²⁹ Juvenal XII. 39: 'vestem purpuream, teneris quoque Maecenatibus aptam'; cf. Martial X. 73.

¹³⁰ Augustus' letter, ap. Macrob. *Sat.* II. 4. 12 = *Epistula* xxxii, in Imp. Caesar Augustus, *Operum Fragmenta*, ed. Malcovati⁵.

¹³¹ Suet., *Nero* 38. 2: 'turris Maecenatiana'.

¹³² e.g. Suet., *D. Aug.* 72. 2, *Tib.* 15. 1.

¹³³ 'Vina Maecenatiana', Pliny, *NH* xiv 67.

¹³⁴ Pliny, *NH* VIII. 170 (attempt to introduce a new dainty: young donkey).

¹³⁵ Dio Cassius LIV. 30. 5; Plut., *Amat.* 427.

¹³⁶ See p. 100 below.

¹³⁷ Of Verres, Cic. *Verr.* v. 33; of Catiline, Cic., *Cat.* II. 23; of Antony, *Phil.* II. 67 etc. Cicero likes to associate dicing with *mimi* and *lenones* and *adulteri*: e.g. *Verr.* II. 1. 33; *Catil.* II. 23; *Phil.* VIII. 26.

¹³⁸ Hor., *C.* II. 7. 25; Prop. II. 24. 13; IV. 8. 45; Ovid, *Ars* II. 205. It would not be unfair to say that the Propertian and Ovidian passages associate dicing with just the same things as Cicero does; Horace goes no further than drunkenness.

inspiration,¹³⁹ and (of course) forbidden by the law.¹⁴⁰ Augustus himself was fond of dicing,¹⁴¹ not restricting himself to the permitted period of the *Saturnalia*, nor avoiding publicity, but giving stake-money to his guests to enable them to play. It is interesting here to observe not only that (as usual) the poets are seen to be assuming the background which was real in life, but also that we have here another example of something not ceasing to happen because it was against the law. The importance of this will become clear later.¹⁴²

As important as any of these aspects of luxury and pleasure is, of course, music. We need not here go into the controversial question how far an indigenous music ever existed at Rome, free of Greek influence; but it is clear that in the late Republic and early Empire the music favoured by the upper class was effectively a branch of the international Hellenistic art. G. Wille, whose book *Musica Romana* (1967) is not inclined to exaggerate Greek influence,¹⁴³ shows that Roman *Tafelmusik* (p. 413) was in origin a Greek innovation, just as Roman theatrical music (p. 105) was heavily indebted to Hellenistic practice. So of course were dancing (p. 190 ff.) and instrumental music (p. 218), and one need hardly labour the point in connection with the *Carmen Saeculare* of Horace.

Before coming to the *meretrices* and other girls, it may be well to approach the problem of the life of luxury at Rome from another angle. This is provided by the existence of the epitaphs of a large number of servants of the Imperial household; from these we can form an idea of the staff of a wealthy Roman family of the Augustan period. This evidence, while it is terse and limited, has the advantage that it is not open to the charge of being a literary *locus communis* merely; these people existed.

The reader of these inscriptions¹⁴⁴ is at once struck by what Weaver calls 'the almost absurdly minute differentiation of duties that seems to have been characteristic of the Palatine establishment'.¹⁴⁵ The number of slaves and freedmen is very large, and even so represents only a fraction of the household,¹⁴⁶ and their titles denote defined duties. The great majority of their names are Greek; in the case of these slaves, it is not necessary to go into the vexed question how far, in the population at large, a Greek name meant an Eastern origin.¹⁴⁷ The point is that such people, whether or not they were of Greek blood, naturally bore Greek names—because the skills and the refinement they practised were felt to be Greek. Moreover we must remember that Augustus claimed to live a modest, old-fashioned domestic life, and that this claim was not thought absurd;¹⁴⁸ it must follow that the state of affairs revealed by these inscriptions cannot be very greatly different from that in other eminent families of the time.¹⁴⁹

In the Appendix I list more than a hundred posts which we know to have been held, in the reigns of Augustus and Tiberius, by at least one person with a Greek name. In many cases we know of more than one, e.g. *aurifices*, *ILS* vi. 3927 Zeuxis; 3943 Hedys; 3944 Agathopus; 3946 Epythycanus; 3950 Protogenes. The evidence is not complete.¹⁵⁰ The

¹³⁹ 'In all classes of Roman society gambling and gaming (*alea*) were favourite relaxations, borrowed in every one of their many forms from the Greeks', J. P. V. D. Balsdon, *Life and Leisure*, 154.

¹⁴⁰ We are not well informed about the laws on gaming: cf. *RE*, s.v. 'alea', 1359; Denniston on Cic., *Phil.* II. 56. Horace in one of his puritanical poems calls it 'vetita legibus alea,' *C.* III. 24. 58.

¹⁴¹ Suet., *D. Aug.* 71: 'Aleae rumorem nullo modo expavit, lusitque simpliciter et palam . . . praeterquam Decembri mense, aliis quoque festis et profestis diebus.' The chapter goes on to quote letters of Augustus on the subject of his gaming.

¹⁴² cf. p. 100 f. below.

¹⁴³ 'It sets out to redress the imbalance in favour of Greek music, which has tended to eclipse the Roman achievements,' says E. K. Borthwick in his review (*C.R.* n.s. 19 (1969), 343).

¹⁴⁴ *CIL* vi. 3926–4326, *columnarium* of Livia; 4327–4413, *familia* of the children of Nero Drusus; 4414–4880, *familia* of Marcella; 4881–5178, 5179–538, 5539–678, others of Tiberian and Claudian date; 8639–9101, *officiales ex familia Augusta*. Some names also turn up elsewhere.

¹⁴⁵ P. R. C. Weaver, *Familia Caesaris* (1972), 6.

¹⁴⁶ e.g. Augustus himself is not adequately represented.

¹⁴⁷ In opposition to the view of Tenney Frank and Kajanto (recently in *Latomus* 27 (1968), 517–34), that all Greek *cognomina* show Eastern provenance, L. R. Taylor argued that they showed servile origin only (*AJP* 82 (1961), 127). Probably H. Chantraine is right to take the 'resigned view' that the preponderance of Greek names is an indication of Eastern origin for most of these people, but that for individual cases certainty is impossible (*Freigelassene und Sklaven im Dienst der röm. Kaiser* (1967), 135). But in the cases here dealt with the special skills greatly add to the likelihood of Eastern extraction.

¹⁴⁸ Suet., *D. Aug.* 73 on the *parsimonia* of his furniture; Tacitus, *Ann.* v. 1: 'sanctitas domus priscum ad morem'. This is not all hindsight in the light of later excesses. Augustus' women-folk made his clothes, and his daughter was given an austere upbringing (Suet., *D. Aug.* 64).

¹⁴⁹ Rightly emphasized by G. Boulvert, *Esclaves et affranchis impériaux* (1970), 24; cf. Weaver, op. cit. (n. 138), 228.

¹⁵⁰ Thus we have a *praepositus cellariis* but not a *cellarius*.

point of the list is to give an idea of the number of contexts in which an Augustan grandee found himself in constant and intimate contact with Greek or Hellenized servants; for any refined or skilful service, from the wardrobe to the archives and from the cup-bearer to the doctor, this must have been overwhelmingly the rule. Reflection on this fact will suggest its importance for the question of Greek influence on Augustan literature. It is one aspect, which happens to be demonstrable by us, of 'la société tout hellénisée'¹⁵¹ in which these poets lived. We return now to the life of love and its presentation in poetry. Influential voices say that poetical treatment is quite separate from real life; the argument here advanced is that it is not. Wilhelm Kroll gave a masterly and underrated survey of these matters,¹⁵² emphasizing the presence and importance in Rome since at least 160 B.C. of Greek ἑταῖροι and ἐρώμενοι. Apart from general statements that this was so,¹⁵³ in our fragmentary evidence, Lucilius presents us with Hymnis and Collyra and Cretaea and Lamia and Bitto¹⁵⁴ on the distaff side, and Gentius and Macedo and Agrion¹⁵⁵ among the boys; both heterosexual and homosexual intrigues and scandal bulk large in his fragments,¹⁵⁶ as does the excessive vogue for Greek things, customs and language, one of his commonest subjects of ridicule,¹⁵⁷ although of course Lucilius himself was thoroughly steeped in every form of Greek culture.¹⁵⁸ The youthful Sulla received a useful legacy from Nicopolis;¹⁵⁹ Cicero makes great play in the *Verrines* with Verres' mistress Chelidon;¹⁶⁰ later we cannot doubt the historical reality or the effectiveness of Cytheris, mistress of Antony and of Gallus, with whom Cicero once found himself dining.¹⁶¹ It is from our point of view interesting that she was a poetical figure too, being the heroine of Gallus' elegies.¹⁶² No doubt Acme, in Catullus 45, is such another *libertina*. 'These relationships form the background for the fully developed love-poetry of the time,' wrote Kroll,¹⁶³ and it is hard not to feel that such a view is almost inevitable.

Yet Professor Williams is sure that 'the erotic themes of these poems have nothing to do with Horace's real life',¹⁶⁴ and Professor Nisbet and Miss Hubbard know that Horace's own love affairs involved only 'compliant *scorta*' who were 'totally unlike' the glamorous ladies of the *Odes*.¹⁶⁵ As for all the poems on homosexual liaisons, these are 'imaginative compositions that have no connection with real life',¹⁶⁶ and a 'conventional motif from Greek erotic poetry', which 'should not be over-literally interpreted',¹⁶⁷ and the pretty Lycidas of Horace *C. I. 4* 'suggests the fantasies of Greek symposiastic verse',¹⁶⁸ why not also the realities of Graeco-Roman symposiastic life?

One is reminded by these edifying views of Prosper Mérimée's judgment on Baudelaire. When *Les Fleurs du Mal* was threatened, in 1857, with prosecution for obscenity, Mérimée was asked to use his influence to prevent it. Declining to intervene, he wrote urbanely: 'un livre intitulé *Fleurs du Mal*, livre très médiocre, nullement dangereux, où il y a quelques étincelles de poésie, comme il peut y en avoir dans un pauvre garçon qui ne connaît pas la vie et qui en est las parce que une grisette l'a trompé. Je ne connais pas l'auteur, mais je parierais qu'il est niais et honnête'¹⁶⁹ ('I don't know the author, but I'd bet my bottom

¹⁵¹ P. Boyancé in *Entretiens Hardt* II (1956), 170. This essay on Propertius handles the question of Greek influence with much more subtlety than it sometimes receives. In the same volume p. 250, L. P. Wilkinson: 'Educated Romans lived in a half-Greek social atmosphere.'

¹⁵² W. Kroll, *op. cit.* (n. 30), 160 ff.: 'Das Liebesleben.' Also P. Grimal, *L'amour à Rome* (1963); A. La Penna, *Orazio e la morale mondana europea* (1969), 91 ff.: 'Vita galante della capitale.'

¹⁵³ cf. e.g. Cichorius, *Untersuchungen zu Lucilius*, 161 '... die eleganten Courtisanen. Mit solchen, meist Griechinnen, hat schon damals die vornehme römische Jugend länger dauernde Verhältnisse zu schliessen gepflegt...'

¹⁵⁴ Fr. 888; 894; 940; 1115; 1193; 517; 925; 1065 Marx.

¹⁵⁵ Fr. 272-5 Marx. These were their real names, according to Apuleius, *Apol.* 10.

¹⁵⁶ e.g. fr. 72; 418-20; 730; 851-69; 1058.

¹⁵⁷ e.g. fr. 88 ff., (Albucius); 15-6; 184-8.

¹⁵⁸ Cichorius, *op. cit.* (n. 146), 48 speaks of his 'völliges Durchtränktsein mit hellenischer Bildung,

hellenischer Wissenschaft und hellenischen Anschauungen.' The exclusive emphasis on Callimachus as a source, in M. Puelma-Piwonka, *Lucilius und Kallimachos* (1949), seems to me much too one-sided.

¹⁵⁹ Plut., *Sulla* 2. She was κοινή μὲν, εὐπορος δέ.

¹⁶⁰ Cic., *Verr.* I. 104 etc. According to Cicero, she was the real power during Verres' praetorship. In Sicily he consoled himself with one Tertia, significantly the daughter of a mime-actor named Isidorus, *Verr.* II. 3. 78; 5. 31.

¹⁶¹ *ad Fam.* IX. 26.

¹⁶² She was said to have recited the sixth Eclogue of Virgil: Serv. in *Buc.* VI. 11. G. Wille, *Musica Romana*, 226, accepts the story.

¹⁶³ *Kultur der ciceronischen Zeit* II, 45.

¹⁶⁴ G. Williams in *JRS* 52 (1962), 42.

¹⁶⁵ *op. cit.*, 73.

¹⁶⁶ Williams, *Tradition and Originality*, 556.

¹⁶⁷ Nisbet and Hubbard, *op. cit.* (n. 4), pp. xv, 71.

¹⁶⁸ *Critical Essays on Roman Literature: Elegy and Lyric*, ed. J. P. Sullivan (1962), 194.

¹⁶⁹ *Correspondance générale* VIII. 365.

dollar that he's still a virgin and quite a decent fellow' ¹⁷⁰). At this time Baudelaire was thirty-six and had been living for fifteen years a life of 'luxury, frivolity, and dissipation'; ¹⁷¹ for fifteen years he had been suffering from a venereal disease. The respectable have learned not to be shocked by erotic poets, but perhaps it is no less of a temptation to believe that 'really' they are good bourgeois all the time. The private life of the Latin love poets will have borne little resemblance to that of a modern scholar.

A corner stone in the argument is the interpretation of Catullus xvi:

Pedicabo ego uos et irrumabo,
Aureli pathice et cinaede Furi,
Qui me ex uersiculis meis putastis,
Quod sunt molliculi, parum pudicum.
Nam castum esse decet pium poetam
Ipsum, uersiculos nihil necesse est,
Qui tum denique habent salem ac leporem,
Si sunt molliculi ac parum pudici,
Et quod pruriat incitare possunt,
Non dico pueris, sed his pilosis
Qui duros nequeunt mouere lumbos.
Vos, quei milia multa basiorum
Legistis, male me marem putatis?
Pedicabo ego uos et irrumabo.

Of this poem, our writers say: 'Catullus replies that a poet uses an autobiographical form but that this is poetic license and no evidence for his life. This plea becomes a commonplace with Roman poets, and it will sufficiently protect the conqueror of the Cimbri' ¹⁷² (sc. Q. Lutatius Catulus, who composed paederastic epigrams based on—not 'translated from' ¹⁷³—Hellenistic models). Is there not a *petitio principii* involved in relying upon one 'poetic commonplace' as truthful and reliable, in order to show up other poetical utterances as conventional and unreal? ¹⁷⁴ And in any case Catullus' answer to the slander of which he complains is to threaten drastic homosexual chastisement—which shows that the charge was not homosexual love as such, but effeminacy. ¹⁷⁵ To this alone could such a threat, however humorous, be a rebuttal.

The same procedure seems detectable also in the use of Horace, *Sermones* 1. 2 in order to show that 'in real life' the poet had to do only with 'compliant *scorta*', not with the more glamorous and capricious girls of the *Odes*. For that poem is itself just as literary as the *Odes*; its theme seems to have been handled by Lucilius, ¹⁷⁶ and is in any case Hellenistic. In fact, the resemblance between lines 105 ff. and Callimachus, *Epigram* 1 (ed. Gow and Page), and between lines 125 ff. and Cercidas 5. 31 f. is actually closer than is Horace's practice with his models in the *Odes*.

In the case of Catullus, we see the poet evading an irritating charge by means of a deft, handy and humorous literary expedient, which does not seem to lend itself to being treated as the touchstone for his whole poetic output. In that of Horace, the genre of his *Sermones* called for the expression of attitudes at once more earthy and more didactic than the *Odes*, ¹⁷⁷ and it is as arbitrary to use the *Sermones* to undercut the *Odes* as it would be to use the *Odes* to blot out (as used to be done in some quarters) the ugly aspects of the *Sermones*. In the

¹⁷⁰ So translated by E. Starkie, *Baudelaire* (1957), 367.

¹⁷¹ E. Starkie, *ibid.* 108.

¹⁷² Williams in *JRS* 52 (1962), 40, quoted with approval by Nisbet and Hubbard, *op. cit.* 71; cf. also *Tradition and Originality*, 555.

¹⁷³ So Williams, *JRS* 52 (1962), 40, 'the epigram of Callimachus of which this is a translation.' In fact, Catullus, *Epigram* 1 Morel stands to Callimachus IV Gow and Page, as Catullus 70 stands to Callimachus XI.

¹⁷⁴ 'The poem *Odes* IV. 10 to Ligurinus is consequently imaginary', Williams *op. cit.*, 41.

¹⁷⁵ 'male . . . marem.' Cf. Tac., *Ann.* XI. 2. 2, Valerius Asiaticus, accused of *mollitia corporis*, retorts to his accuser: 'Interroga, Suilli, filios tuos;

virum esse me fatebuntur.' This illustrates the nature of *mollitia* (Catullus vs. 4 'uersiculis meis . . . quod sunt molliculi'), and also what was, and what was not, felt as really degrading. Boys and girls are offered at the same price in Pompeii—and with Greek names, too: *CIL* IV. 4592: 'Eutycheis Graeca moribus bellis assibus II'; *ibid.* 4024: 'Menander bellis moribus assibus II'. Cf. also nos. 2189, 2191, 2268, 2273, 2278, 2450, 4150, 4441, 5338, 5345.

¹⁷⁶ In *Satire* XXIX: cf. Cichorius, *op. cit.* (n. 146), 157 ff., with the corrections of E. Fraenkel, *Festschrift für R. Reitzenstein* (1931), 121 ff.

¹⁷⁷ See U. Knoche, 'Erlebnis und dichterischer Ausdruck in der lateinischen Poesie', *Gymnasium* 65 (1958), 146–65.

Odes, experience is stylized in a different mode. There, as in Greek lyric, gods intervene personally; there, following Greek stories, the infancy of Horace is presented as a symbolic statement of his poetical vocation,¹⁷⁸ in contrast with the homely details of his schooling in the *Sermones*.¹⁷⁹ But Horace *did* believe in his vocation, certainly no less, perhaps more, than in the importance of the details of his school. And the *vie galante* of Rome is not dissolved into unreality when it is shown that it too contained Greek aspects and elements.¹⁸⁰

For again we must emphasize that not only does literature imitate life, but also life imitates literature.¹⁸¹ Young Romans read Menander and Terence, who took for granted the cultivated *meretrix* and the life of pleasure. Those who were poets were impressed by the erotic poetry of Callimachus and Meleager; the myths, at least since Euripides, had more and more taken on an erotic character. They lived surrounded by the apparatus of pleasure, itself Greek or professing to be so,¹⁸² like Naples, Athens¹⁸³ and the rest, Rome itself offered unlimited opportunities.¹⁸⁴ The picture which Lucilius and Catullus allow us to glimpse, of a *jeunesse dorée* living in a round of parties, affairs, quarrels, jealousies, with some music and poetry—the whole not incompatible with a political career, as we see from men like Calvus, Cornificius and Helvius Cinna¹⁸⁵—is just like that which Sallust ascribes to the circle of Catiline, which we find being lived by Sulla, and which Cicero palliates in the case of M. Caelius Rufus, but excoriates in that of Antony. It also is the life which is described in the *Sermones* and *Epodes*¹⁸⁶ of Horace, and which in the *Odes* and in the elegies of Propertius is, in two different modes, stylized and raised to high poetry, removing what would be too specific and particular, and creating a consistent poetic atmosphere.

The Seventeenth Ode of Horace's first Book can serve here as an example, as it is taken by Nisbet and Hubbard as evidently unreal: 'We must not think of Tyndaris as an actual person . . . rather, she is a dream figure, belonging to the world of Alexandrian pastoral.' They cite as an example of the pastoral background the epigram by Nicaenetus, no. 4 (ed. Gow and Page): another similar passage is [Theocritus] VIII. 55:

ἀλλ' ὑπὸ τᾶ πέτρᾳ τᾶδ' ἄσομαι ἀγκὰς ἔχων τῷ
σύννομα μῆλ' ἔσορῶν Σικελικὴν τ' ἐς ἄλα.

But even Hellenistic poetry relates to life, and the same sensibility comes in a story told by Phylarchus of Ptolemy II: old and gouty, he saw through the window some poor Egyptians making their meal by the river, producing the simplest foods and lying at ease on the sand. 'He cried out, "Unlucky devil that I am! To think that I cannot even be one of those fellows!"'¹⁸⁷ Ptolemy was the patron of poets: the picnics which took place in reality appear, stylized and refined, in verse. *Odes* I. 17 opens with a charming picture of Faunus/Pan coming from Arcadia to look after Horace's flocks on his estate. The third stanza gives the name of the addressee, Tyndaris; after a fourth stanza, on his own divine inspiration and protection as a poet, Horace invites her to enjoy the delights of his valley, to drink and sing, free from the violent attentions of Cyrus. What does Tyndaris' name convey? There

¹⁷⁸ In C. III. 4. Cf. A. La Penna, op. cit. (n. 145), 7 ff.: 'Una autobiografia quasi simbolica.'

¹⁷⁹ *Serm.* II. 6.

¹⁸⁰ The contrary view seems to involve saying that the Romans did not understand their own literature. Valerius Maximus VIII. I. 8 tells of Valerius Valentinus, who lost a law-suit because the jury were disgusted by a poem (quite irrelevant to the case), 'quo puerum praetextatum et ingenuam virginem a se corruptam poetico ioco significaverat.' (Cichorius, op. cit. n. 146, 343, dates the case c. 111 B.C.) The plea which must 'sufficiently protect the conqueror of the Cimbri' seems in this case to have been unavailing; and later poets seem not to have taken warning from it. When Ovid, in his exile, harps on the distinction between his poetry and his morals (*Trist.* I. 9. 59; II. 353 ff.; III 2. 5; *Ex Ponto* II. 7. 47; IV. 8. 19), we detect the pressing motive. Before his disaster, he was proud to call himself 'ille ego nequitiæ Naso poeta meae' (*Am.* II. I. 2): is one more 'real' than the other? If so, which?

¹⁸¹ The point is not missed by Boyancé, *Entretiens*

Fondation Hardt II (1956), 169 ff., 195.

¹⁸² As London courtesans in the nineteenth century might have French *noms de guerre*, and Swedish ones today.

¹⁸³ Where Cicero's son, for example, took to a life of dissipation.

¹⁸⁴ 'Tot tibi tamque dabit formosas Roma puellas/ "haec habet" ut dicas "quidquid in orbe fuit" . . . Quot caelum stellas, tot habet tua Roma puellas,' Ovid, *Ars* I. 55 ff.: a rewarding passage. The commentators point to the parallel of Alexandria, cf. Herodas I. 26 ff. and Headlam ad. loc.

¹⁸⁵ D. van Berchem, 'Cynthia ou la carrière contrariée,' *Mus. Helv.* 5 (1948), 148 points this out; and also that Catullus himself, like Propertius' friend Tullus, took at least the first step in such a career by going out to a province in the *cohors* of a governor.

¹⁸⁶ See *Epodes* VIII, XI, XII, XIII, XIV, XV; *Serm.* I, 2, II, 2, II, 3, etc.

¹⁸⁷ Phylarchus *FGrH* 81 F. 40, ap. Athen. 536c: trans. Loeb.

were real women with the name,¹⁸⁸ but here it surely evokes the mythical daughters of Tyndareus, whom Aphrodite made διγάμους και τριγάμους και λιπεσόνορος (Stesichorus fr. 223 P): both Helen and Clytemnestra left their men. And this Tyndaris is to leave Cyrus for Horace; hence perhaps the name. She is to drink and to sing: her song will be of two women contending for one man, a sly reversal of the present situation.

Is this musical *fête champêtre* a transparent fiction? I think it is not, and that we can trace it through a less exalted stylization to reality. In *C. II. II. 13 ff.* the situation recurs:

cur non sub alta vel platano vel hac
pinu iacentes sic temere et rosa
canos odorati capillos
dum licet, Assyriaque nardo
potamus uncti?

—and fetch Lyde, that *devium scortum*, with her lyre. Here we are less grand: here alone in the *Odes* the low word *scortum* appears, and the country setting is not adorned with gods. Yet the ingredients are all the same: a girl, music, drink, in the country. We come down to realism in Ovid's account of the holiday in honour of Anna Perenna, *Fasti* III. 523 ff.: on the banks of the Tiber,

plebs venit ac virides passim disiecta per herbas
potat, et accumbit cum pare quisque sua.

They too have their music, 535:

illic et cantant quicquid didicere theatris
et iactant faciles ad sua verba manus . . .

This unromantic and plebeian scene is, presumably, 'realistic' enough, and shows that one could have a picnic in Augustan Italy without becoming a poetical fiction. The motif is burlesqued in the *Epodes*, in line with the tough tone of that collection of poems (*Epode* II. 23 ff.: 'libet iacere modo sub antiqua ilice, modo in tenaci gramine,' etc.), developed more sentimentally by Tibullus (II. 5. 95 ff.):

tunc operata deo pubes discumbet in herba,
arboris antiquae qua levis umbra cadit

and treated in different ways in the two *Odes*.¹⁸⁹ In I. 17 Virgilian allusions raise the tone and provide the god (Faunus comes from *Georgic* I. 16): Horace invites Tyndaris into a country equipped with Virgilian deities, in which it is natural for him to speak of his own poetic inspiration and protection. The gentle humour of the end ('I am nicer than Cyrus') gives a characteristically Horatian irony to the close. The poem, then, is not a fantasy in no relation to life, a 'dream', but a stylized and refined version of reality.¹⁹⁰

A second example may be Horace's poems on the theme of the amorous ageing woman. In *Epodes* VIII and XII it is developed with ferocious obscenity, in accordance with the Archilochian *animi* emulated in the iambic poems; in the *Odes* with urbanity and irony (*C. I. 25*; III. 15; IV. 13), avoiding obscene words. Nisbet and Hubbard, on *C. I. 25*, say: 'of course, the unreality of the situation is obvious . . .'. By contrast, A. La Penna inclines to believe that Horace when young and poor had to undergo with wealthy women of a certain age the experiences he evokes so repulsively in the *Epodes*: 'si ha l'impressione che l'esperienza sia reale'.¹⁹¹ This would help to explain Horace's obsession with the subject;

¹⁸⁸ Thus *CIL* IV. 5090 (Pompeii): probably no better than she ought to have been.

¹⁸⁹ It is also adjacent to a 'philosophical' theme, that of 'simple food in simple surroundings': e.g. Augustus' boasts of his simple country fare, *Suet.*, *D. Aug.* 76, and Seneca, *Epp.* 87, 'culcita in terra iacet, ego in culcita . . . de prandio nihil detrahi potuit. . . .'

¹⁹⁰ P. H. Syndikus, *Die Lyrik des Horaz* (1972),

188, who does not deal with the *fête champêtre* theme, yet rightly says of the poem: 'Gewiss ist auch für unser Gedicht die oben skizzierte Lebenswirklichkeit die Grundlage, auf der es gewachsen ist, aber es ist keine Darstellung einer Realität, sondern ihre Stilisierung, ihre Sublimierung in die Ebene der Kunst.'

¹⁹¹ op. cit. (n. 145), 17 f.

for after all the discovery of literary parallels is only the beginning, not the end, of an answer to the question.¹⁹² Roman society contained such ladies, and a cruel use is made of the charge by Cicero against Clodia in the speech *pro Caelio* 36. The poems versify and transmute reality.

Williams suggests that 'licentious mixed parties were unusual at Rome';¹⁹³ the overwhelming balance of the evidence seems to me to be that on the contrary they were very common. A poem like Horace, *Odes* I. 27, for example, is thus to be seen rather differently, from the way it is seen by some recent interpreters. 'The setting is Greek and the element of reality negligible', writes one¹⁹⁴; from our present point of view the distinction and the inference both seem misleading. Cicero professes some self-consciousness at dining with so very notorious a woman as Cytheris, but this seems to be only because of his own age and status; and consoling himself with the stock parallel of Aristippus, he goes on: 'convivio delector . . .' There is no reason to suppose that Atticus, who was also present, felt any embarrassment.^{194a}

As for homosexual relationships in poetry and in life, one of the chief arguments used by those who regard the poems as 'unreal' is that at Rome such practices were 'the object of penal legislation'.¹⁹⁵ I do not find this such an obstacle as do its proponents. We have seen the light-hearted way in which Augustus himself disregarded the laws about dicing; he was not less complaisant about the affair of Maecenas with the actor Bathyllus.¹⁹⁶ The dourness of Augustus' morality can in any case be exaggerated. In the triumphal period he had been both target and author of highly improper lampoons; after Actium, Antony made an appeal to him, 'reminding him of their friendship and kinship . . . and recounting all the amorous adventures and youthful pranks which they had shared together.'¹⁹⁷ The few fragments we have of Augustus' letters show him addressing Maecenas as 'μόλλογμα μοεχαρῦν'¹⁹⁸ and Horace as 'purissimus penis'.¹⁹⁹ The grimness of the end of the reign, when Maecenas was dead and the Julias had disgraced the family, is not to be reflected back to its beginning. As Suetonius puts it (*D. Aug.* 69), 'adulteria quidem exercuisse ne amici quidem negant.' Moral legislation at Rome was in any case much easier to enact than to enforce. Philosophers and *rhetores* were expelled from Rome in 161, *rhetores latini* in 92: but 'the edict remained ineffectual'.²⁰⁰ The sad history of the sumptuary laws makes the point only too clear. Aulus Gellius II. 24 and Macrobius, *Sat.* III. 17 list the laws which attempted to outlaw extravagant living at Rome. Lucilius ridiculed that of Fannius,²⁰¹ and urged the evasion of that of Licinius²⁰²; Sulla breached his own laws on the subject;²⁰³ the law of Antius Restio, says Macrobius sadly, was rendered ineffectual by the 'obstinatio luxuriae et vitiorum firma concordia'; Caesar as Dictator had to admit the failure of his own sumptuary laws.²⁰⁴ Even the matrimonial legislation of Augustus, which so impresses modern writers, was carried with difficulty and enforced without much success.²⁰⁵

¹⁹² F. Cairns, *Generic Composition*, 89 thinks C. I, 25 is a κῶμος and means 'therefore let me in now, before it's too late': ('since no other hypothesis gives Horace a reason for saying what he says to Lydia, it may be presumed . . .'). This will surely be one of the curiosities of scholarship; did anyone ever hope to soften a girl's heart by telling her that soon, tortured by unsatisfied lust, she will be vainly accosting men in the street? The inadequacy of the generic method to answer all questions about these poets is here strikingly apparent ('since no other hypothesis gives Horace a reason . . .').

¹⁹³ *JRS* 52 (1962), 41.

¹⁹⁴ *Critical Essays on Roman Literature: Elegy and Lyric*, ed. J. P. Sullivan (1962), 188.

^{194a} Cic., *ad fam* IX. 26.

¹⁹⁵ *JRS* 52 (1962), 40. One notes that the jurors at the trial of Clodius were swayed, according to Cicero, not only by 'noctes certarum mulierum' but also by 'adulescentulorum nobilium introductiones' (*ad Att.* I. 16. 5).

¹⁹⁶ Tac., *Ann.* I. 54. 3, 'Augustus dum Maecenati obtemperat effuso in amorem Bathylli . . .' Cf.

R. Syme, *Roman Revolution*, 342; Dio Cassius LIV. 17. 5.

¹⁹⁷ Suet., *D. Aug.* 69; Martial XI. 20 = Augustus, *Carmen* IV ed. Malcovati. Martial, no mean judge, is impressed by the *Romana simplicitas* of Augustus' obscene verses; Cassius Dio LI. 8. 1, trans. Cary (Loeb). It is not easy to see when this would have been invented, if not true.

¹⁹⁸ *Epistulae* fr. XXXII, ed. Malcovati.

¹⁹⁹ *ibid.* fr. XLI.

²⁰⁰ Schanz-Hosius I, 210.

²⁰¹ 'Fanni centussis misellus,' fr. 1172M.

²⁰² 'legem vitemus Licini,' fr. 1200.

²⁰³ Plut., *Sulla* 35.

²⁰⁴ Cic., *Att.* XIII. 7. 1: Caesar announces his intention to stay in Rome, 'ne se absente leges suae neglegerentur sicut esset neglecta sumptuosa.'

²⁰⁵ P. A. Brunt, *Italian Manpower*, 558 ff.: the Lex Julia apparently, although it aroused bitter resentment, did not have the effect intended; and even after the law of A.D. 9, 'the copious testimony to the later prevalence of celibacy and childlessness attests its continuing failure' (565).

Propertius might well feel that he was quite right to have said (II. 7. 5) that Augustus had no power over the heart:

‘At magnus Caesar.’ sed magnus Caesar in armis:
devictae gentes nil in amore valent.

It was easier to conquer the world than to fly in the face of fashion.²⁰⁶

The lack of adequate police or other means of enforcing such laws was no doubt part of the reason for their failure, but it must also have been true that public opinion, whatever moralists might say, did not really want them enforced. When we reflect that the authors of sumptuary legislation included Sulla and Caesar, two men notorious for debt, extravagance and profligacy, and that prominent among the moralists was the plutocratic and shady figure of Sallust, we can perhaps understand that there was a good deal of insincerity about the whole thing. The old Lex Scantinia on homosexuality was indeed invoked ‘as a weapon in political manoeuvres between Caelius and Appius Claudius in 50 B.C.’,²⁰⁷ but then the law on *perduellio* was invoked against C. Rabirius in 63, and that had been a dead letter for generations;²⁰⁸ and perusal of the letter in which Caelius describes his own affair to Cicero (*ad fam.* VIII. 12) does not convey a sense of the majesty of the Lex Scantinia, or of its serious application.²⁰⁹ In the political prosecutions of the end of the Republic, anything went.

We have seen that the poets cheerfully confess to dicing and luxury, laws or no laws, and we have found that in this they were true to their society. The same is, I think, true of their allusions struck to pederasty. Before proceeding to positive evidence, I draw attention to the tendency in some academic minds to be excessively impressed by codes of law, and to infer that what is forbidden does not happen. This touching belief led, for example, Sydney and Beatrice Webb, writing in 1935, to form a view of Stalin’s Russia not entirely in accordance with the facts;²¹⁰ it would have led a trusting enquirer into the *Statuta et Decreta* of the University of Oxford (*si parva licet componere magnis*) in recent years to an equally misleading view of affairs in that body.²¹¹

The evidence collected by Kroll,²¹² and indeed by Nisbet and Hubbard,²¹³ strongly suggests that relations with boys, provided they were not *ingenui*, were both very common and very lightly viewed. Kroll points to the number of jokes and allusions to the subject in Plautus, to the vocabulary of abuse in Catullus, to the regularity of accusations and scandal

²⁰⁶ Two more examples: the decree of the Senate in A.D. 15 that pantomimes might only be performed publicly, not in private houses. ‘This soon became a dead letter,’ Friedländer, *Roman Life and Manners* II, 110. And (G. Wille, *Musica Romana*, 219): ‘the censors of 115 B.C. banned foreign music from Rome; in the following year, M. Junius Silanus and Q. Curtius struck a coin with a Cithara on one side . . .’. M. H. Crawford (*RRC* no. 285) dates the coin to 116 or 115; the contrast is perhaps not much less striking, even so.

²⁰⁷ Williams, *Tradition and Originality*, 551.

²⁰⁸ cf. Mommsen, *Staatsrecht* II, 618. Heitland comments gruffly (edn. of Cic. *pro C. Rabirio* (1884), 9): ‘It is clear that this antiquated form of trial was revived simply as a convenient means of securing a triumph for the so-called “popular” party.’

²⁰⁹ *ad Fam.* VIII. 12. 3, ‘Impudentissimi homines summis Circensibus ludis meis postulandum me lege Scantinia curarunt. vix hoc erat Pola elocutus, cum ego Appium censorem eadem lege postulavi. quod melius caderet nihil vidi,’ etc.

²¹⁰ S. and B. Webb, *Soviet Communism: A New Civilization?* (1935): on the question, Is Stalin a Dictator? : ‘First let it be noted that, unlike Mussolini, Hitler, and other modern dictators, Stalin is not invested by law with any authority over his fellow citizens . . . He has not even the extensive power which the American Constitution entrusts for four years to every successive president. . . . In this pattern individual dictatorship has no place’ (431–3). On the purges, ‘Every decision regarding a Party member must be concisely “motivated”, and the

minute has to be accompanied by documentary evidence of the charges. . . . There is, from every decision, an effective right of appeal. . . . This appeal may be pursued right up to the Central Cleansing Committee in Moscow. . .’ (381). And: ‘the constitution of the USSR provides for the active participation of the people in the work of government in more than one way’ (3).

²¹¹ It appears from the *Statuta* for 1963, for example, that in that year members of the University of Oxford could be punished for failing to step out of the path of the holder of a higher degree; that ‘walking idly in the street’ was also a punishable offence; that all undergraduates must be in their Colleges by nine o’clock, and might not enter any building where alcohol or tobacco was sold; that the University officers had power to enter the houses of citizens at any hour of the day or night, to see if members of the University were there improperly; that *gladiatorum spectacula* might be given in Oxford only with the consent of the Vice-Chancellor, who might imprison *gladiatores* who contravened this; and so on. All this, needless to say, was the merest fantasy.

²¹² *Die Kultur der ciceronischen Zeit*, 177 ff.

²¹³ op. cit. 71: after declaring that, in *C.* I. 4, ‘the homosexual implication has no bearing on Sestius’ actual behaviour, but is a conventional motif derived from Greek poetry’, they go on: ‘In fact, the practice was widespread (*Cic. Cael.* 6–9, *RE* XI. 905 f.), and at least where slave boys were concerned seems to have provoked little censure. . . .’

of this sort in the late Republic, and to the evidence of Pompeian inscriptions. Insufficient consideration has been paid also to his citation of the entry in the excellent Praenestine *fasti*,²¹⁴ of Augustan date, for 25 April: 'Festus est puerorum lenoniorum quia proximus superior meretricum est': that is, boys employed in male prostitution had their own holiday, and this was duly recorded in the State calendar. We have only to try to imagine a public festival, say, for adulterous matrons, to see what the Roman state really thought criminal.²¹⁵ The index to Volume VI of *CIL* lists from the inscriptions of the city of Rome no less than twenty-eight men named Paederos, a statistic hard to reconcile with a public opinion which really condemned such loaves. In such a society the poets write sometimes of the love of boys; a society in which Maecenas was the subject of scandal for his relations with Bathyllus, and in which Horace wrote a poem to him introducing that name in a way which must have been meant to be obvious to all those in the know (*Epode* XIV).²¹⁶ Horace accuses himself of 'mille puellarum, puerorum mille furores',²¹⁷ and in that one of the *Sermones* which is sometimes taken to reveal his 'real' ideas, lumps the two sexes blandly together.²¹⁸ As for the final argument,²¹⁹ that the homosexual poems are shown to be unreal because they lack 'inner emotional life' and are less passionate than those on women, that is just the aspect of such affairs which the poets claim as their great advantage.²²⁰ To sum up, then: the practice was common in society, it was in reality less disapproved of than people pretended, Maecenas was a subject of scandal for it, boys with Greek and Roman names had appeared in Latin poetry at least since Lucilius, these poets write about it: *but*—it is in them exclusively Hellenistic and literary. The last step seems somehow unexpected, does it not?

The object of this discussion has been to suggest that the relation of literature to life has been distorted by inelastic conceptions of 'the Greek' and 'the Roman'. Of course we are not to start writing a diary of Horace's intrigues: the days have passed when we used to wonder whether Chloe came before or after Glycera, or how to fit together the occasional chronological hints in Propertius. But the central question with Augustan poetry remains that of the degree and manner of its removal from reality; and in this we can make out, in our other sources, a world thoroughly permeated with Hellenistic elements of every sort. They are not transposing the reader into a realm of pure fantasy, but making poetical (and that includes making it more universal, less individual)²²¹ a mode of life familiar to their readers. That conclusion, if accepted, has its importance for the other areas of their poetry.

The reluctance to accept it is perhaps partly due to the disappearance in the modern world of the *demi-monde*, a society with its own etiquette, as distinct from marriage as it was from the drabs who were picked up in the street.²²² In the nineteenth century such women as, to take English examples, Harriette Wilson, the mistress of the Duke of Wellington, and Mary Ann Clarke, the mistress of the Duke of York, were treated, within certain limits, as ladies; except of course that they did not meet gentlemen's wives and sisters. The *Memoirs* of Harriette Wilson²²³ provide in many respects an illuminating parallel to these poets. She is fluent in French (Greek the language of love at Rome²²⁴), she is musical,²²⁵ she loves

²¹⁴ *CIL* I², p. 236 = *Inscriptiones Italiae* XIII. 2. 17, of A.D. 6-9. 'Ceteris fastis quos habemus hi Praenestini et magnitudine lapidum quibus inscripti sunt et copia rerum adnotatarum longe praestant', Degrassi p. 141.

²¹⁵ cf. the curious anecdote in Valerius Maximus VIII. 1. 12.

²¹⁶ It is notable that his commentators largely ignore this: nothing in Heinze, Lejay, Tescari, Wickham.

²¹⁷ *Serm.* II. 3. 325. Cf. Cic., *ad Att.* I. 16. 5, quoted in n. 184.

²¹⁸ *Serm.* I. 2. 117. Ovid has a characteristic reason for liking boys 'less' than women: *Ars* II. 683 f.

²¹⁹ e.g. Williams, *Tradition and Originality*, 553.

²²⁰ Propertius II. 4 fin.; Juvenal VI. 34. 7; perhaps already in Lucilius (Marx on fr. 866: referred to women instead by Cichorius, *Untersuchungen*, 162); boys are less trouble and less demanding than women.

²²¹ 'Les Anciens s'appliquaient à éliminer de leurs expériences ce qu'elles pouvaient avoir de trop

personnel, pour donner à l'expression de leurs sentiments une valeur plus générale,' Van Berchem, *Mus. Helv.* 5 (1958), 138. See also H. P. Syndikus, *Die Lyrik des Horaz* (1972), I, 188 f.

²²² Harriette Wilson, *Memoirs* 234, describes her horror at getting accidentally into a position where she is treated in this way: cf. the 'common harlots' with whom Propertius contrasts Cynthia (II. 23, II. 24), and the *togatae* recommended by Horace, *Serm.* I. 2. 82 ff.

²²³ (Shortened) edition by Lesley Blanch, 1964.

²²⁴ Lucretius IV. 1166 ff.; Martial X. 68; Juvenal VI. 185; Boyancé in *REL* 34 (1956), 125.

²²⁵ 'Music I always had a natural talent for. I played well upon the pianoforte' (*Memoirs*, 29). Cf. also William Hickey's account of Fanny Temple (*Memoirs of William Hickey*, ed. P. Quennell (1960) 54): 'She was a mistress of music, had an enchanting voice, which she managed with the utmost skill, danced elegantly and spoke French *assez bien*...' Epitaphs of Roman women with musical skills: G. Wille, *Musica Romana*, 218 n. 91, and *ibid.* 316-24.

poetry,²²⁶ and each new affair begins with her 'falling in love', always with a man of wealth, and proceeds through the cycle of happiness, jealousy, infidelity, reproaches, reconciliation, and rupture, which is both familiar in the poets and also inevitable in life, if love-affairs are to be made significant enough to provide an engrossing way of life for those with the *otium* and the money needed to live it.

In earlier societies the disreputable world was as stratified and as class-conscious as the respectable world on which it lived, and to whose tastes it had to cater. It is wrong to suppose that outside the pale of the married home there was nothing but the gutter, while poets and their readers nourished in the solitude of their imaginations fantasies of something more refined and more exciting. The Roman courtesan was as familiar with Menander as her patron; Cytheris was presentable enough in manners to dine with senators, as her Hellenistic predecessors had been fit to dine with kings. They all acted out together the same conception of the life of pleasure.²²⁷

As for the question, so vehemently discussed, of the social status of the girls in these poems, what are we to say? For some, Cynthia is obviously a *meretrix*;²²⁸ for others, a married woman.²²⁹ Or perhaps she behaved like a *meretrix* without being one.²³⁰ Did she come from a noble family,²³¹ or was she a *libertina*,²³² or a foreigner²³³? Or is the question not yet decided?²³⁴ Or does it not really matter?²³⁵ Surely the trouble is that the alternatives are too narrowly conceived and too sharply opposed. The *demi-monde* did not contain only professionals of low extraction, although it did include them.²³⁶ It also contained amateurs like Catullus' Lesbia, and quasi-amateurs like Praecia the influential mistress of Cethegus,²³⁷ and noble debauchees like Sulla's daughter Fausta²³⁸ and (unless she was framed) Augustus' daughter Julia. There will also have been many women of less clear-cut status, the 'camp-followers of marriage'.²³⁹ This was a great age of divorce, and some divorcées will have swelled the ranks of the available. So will widows, and grass-widows, and dowry-less girls who failed to marry,²⁴⁰ or whose marriages broke down. The illegitimate, too, will sometimes have lived in this way,²⁴¹ and women who had once enjoyed the half-way status of *concubina* but later lost it. Between *libertinae* and ἑταῖραι, between actresses and *meretrices*, even between some professionals and some *matronae*, the dividing line cannot have been so easy to draw as in theory, perhaps, it should have been. Propertius follows up one side of

²²⁶ 'I know not how to praise the poet as he merits. Yet few, perhaps, among the most learned, have in their hearts done more honour to some of the natural beauties of Shakespeare than I have' (*Memoirs*, 57). Cf. 353, her letters to 'poor dear Lord Byron'. This point is worth dwelling upon because it is often assumed that, in the words of Nisbet and Hubbard (p. xv), 'the blonde and musical girls owe more to the conventions of erotic writing than to the realities of *Venus parabilis*.' If you wanted girls who possessed or simulated musical and poetical interests, it is impossible to doubt that they were forthcoming; just as they were in the *Quartier latin* in the 1850's. Cf. G. Wille, *Musica Romana*, 234 ff., 'Horaz in der Musik der Antike.' He believes that Horace's poems were sung; and that for instance C. iv. 11. 34 ff., 'condisce modos, amanda/voce quos reddas', is to be read in the light of the fact that Horace did in fact teach the choir to sing the *Carmen Saeculare*. As for the blondeness, both hair-dye and wigs feature in the poets (e.g. Nisbet and Hubbard on C. i. 5. 3), as they did in life.

²²⁷ Cf. P. Grimal, *L'amour à Rome*, 153.

²²⁸ E. Burck, *Gymn.* 70 (1963), 89 = *Vom Menschenbild in der röm. Lit.* (1966), 238: 'Propertius 1. 4 shows unambiguously that she was a *meretrix*'. So too Camps, edn. of Propertius I (1966), 6.

²²⁹ G. Williams, *Tradition and Originality*, 528 ff. 'Come se lecto non fosse presso i Romani il divorzio!' is the comment on this of L. Alfonsi, *Studi Calderini-Paribeni* I (1956), 200.

²³⁰ G. Luck, *Gnomon* 34 (1962), 156.

²³¹ G. Luck, *ibid.*, 'Wir besitzen in l. 16 ein untrügliches Zeugnis für Cynthias vornehme Abkunft.'

²³² F. O. Copley, *Exclusus Amator = TAPA* Monograph 17 (1956), 103, 'Delia, like all the women of elegy, was a *liberta*.'

²³³ F. Cairns, *Generic Composition*, 156, 'Foreigners such as elegiac mistresses . . .'

²³⁴ 'Adhuc sub iudice lis est,' A. Guillemin, *REL* 18 (1940), 100.

²³⁵ L. Alfonsi, *op. cit.* (n. 224), 199.

²³⁶ In poetry, for example, Prop. II. 6, 'Non ita complebant Ephyracae Laidos aedes,' and Horace, C. II. 11. 21, 'quis devium scortum eliciet domo Lyden?'

²³⁷ Plut., *Lucullus* 6.

²³⁸ Hor., *Serm.* I. 2. 64, cf. Münzer in *RE* s.v. 'Cornelius', nr. 436. Also Fulvia: *RE* s.v. 'Fulvius', nr. 112, 'Eine vornehme aber ganz sittlose Frau': Sempronia (Sallust, *Catiline* 25), etc.

²³⁹ A phrase used in conversation by Sir Ronald Syme.

²⁴⁰ Harriette Wilson's friend Julia Johnstone came of a distinguished family but ruined herself by an early indiscretion and lived as a kept mistress.

²⁴¹ cf. R. Syme, 'Bastards in the Roman Aristocracy,' *PAPhS* 104 (1960), 323-7. He points out that we hear surprisingly little of such people, who must have existed. It seems not to occur to scholars that Cynthia, if descended from the poet Hostius, might be so by the left hand.

the poetry of Catullus ²⁴² (and, no doubt, of Gallus) in depicting the life of love as deeply serious. Such a conception inevitably demands that the poems should be concerned with one woman, and that the emotions, to be deep, must be painful. Horace did not aim to produce that effect, and so he writes of many different women, and his tone is ironical and oblique, making no show of profound passion. But it is the same life which they both, in their different ways, describe; a life of pleasure in which the important feminine roles could be played satisfactorily only by sophisticated women. And in Rome such women must either have been of Eastern origin, or have had a veneer of Hellenistic culture.

In conclusion, we must observe again that, as we have seen, our interpretation of other aspects of Augustan poetry will not be unaffected by our view of this one. The reality or unreality of pressure from Augustus and Maecenas to write laudatory epic, for example, will affect our view not only of the *Aeneid* but of all the passages where the poets talk of their desire, or their reluctance, to produce epic. Professor Williams and Miss Hubbard, for example, take the view that no such pressure existed.²⁴³ This cannot be fully argued here; but the view I have been defending of the love poems goes naturally with a different interpretation of this matter, too. That is, if they are less remote from life and conventional, then it may seem plausible that on epic, too, the poets are stylizing real facts rather than inventing pure 'literature'; that the Princeps, in his thirst for *gloria*, not unnaturally expected such poems as had been produced for the *res gestae* of Marius, Lucullus, and Caesar;²⁴⁴ that Callimachean *recusatio*, adapting to a new purpose the *Aetia* prologue, had its great vogue for that reason; that the prologue to the Third *Georgic* shows Virgil leading Octavian to believe that he will write it;²⁴⁵ and that it was only as he came to try that he realized decisively that it was impossible, Maecenas all the time acting as infinitely skilled and tactful interpreter and mediator between poets and Emperor. I hope in subsequent arguments to make it probable that in this area, too, it is possible to go too far in separating 'literature' and 'life'.

²⁴² *Entretiens Fondation Hardt* II (1956), 27 ff., 186 ff. L. Alfonsi, *L'Elegia di Propertio* (1945), 15 ff. shows that the *dolorosa vita dell'amore* is for Propertius less violent and more langorous than in Catullus. Propertius himself regarded the 'neoteric' poets as his predecessors, II. 25. 4; 34. 85 ff., where he lists Varro of Atax, Catullus, Calvus and Gallus.

²⁴³ *Tradition and Originality*, 102, cited in n. 6 above. M. E. Hubbard, *Propertius*, 99: the poets 'pretend that Maecenas wanted them to celebrate Augustus' exploits . . . That was formal and conventional, and everybody knew it'. She means by 'pressure' something more forcible than I think was applied ('Even after Maecenas' fall the progress of suppression of opinion was not swift . . . in the twenties poetry was not yet under pressure . . .' (p. 100)). The striking fact remains that in Book I of Propertius, where we have no Maecenas, there is no question of writing epic about Augustus, and no mention of Callimachus; but in the first poem of Book II, addressed to Maecenas, both these things

appear at once. Thereafter they tend to remain together in Propertius' work (II. 10; 34, III. 1; 3; 9), and until Book IV Callimachus serves exclusively as a device of *recusatio*. If there was no real question of an epic, the pattern seems to remain inexplicable.

²⁴⁴ cf. Cicero, *pro Archia*, passim. Cicero had to write his poem himself in the end. Some such laudatory epics really were produced: *Annales Belli Gallici* by Furius Bibaculus, *Bellum Sequanicum* by Varro of Atax, etc. Cf. Schanz-Hosius II, 281 f.

²⁴⁵ E. Norden points out, *Kleine Schriften*, 399 ff., that vv. 16 ff. seem to promise the reverse of the *Aeneid*, not a poem on Troy with glimpses forward to Augustus, but a poem on Augustus with glimpses back to Troy; and that Propertius II. 34. 61 ff. seems to envisage the production by Virgil of *that* poem. The curious manner of the *Georgic* prologue, at once profuse and evasive, is certainly not against the supposition that the poet was conscious of a considerable difficulty.

APPENDIX: SOME IMPERIAL SERVANTS

I list here the posts in the Imperial household for which I have found at least one holder with a Greek name. By 'household' I mean those in domestic contact with the Imperial family, not for example financial agents in the provinces; I have tried to list all and only those which can with reasonable certainty be dated to the reigns of Augustus and Tiberius. Except where noted, the figures refer to *CIL* VI.

adiutor a commentariis ornamentorum: 8951, Chrysaor; *adiutor a sacris*: 8717, Theophilus; *aedituus*: 3926, Euphro; *ancilla*: 5239, Galatea; *arcarius*: 3931, Amiantus; *architectus*: 5738, Anicetus; *argentarius*: 8727, Seleucus; *ab argento*: 5539, Philetus; *ad argentum potorium*: 8730, Anthus; *atriensis*: 3942, Antiochus; *avium fartor*: 8849, Cinnamus; *aurifex*: 3951, Stephanus; *praepositus ab auro gemmato*: 8734, Philetaerus; *balnearius*: 8742, Colchus; *a bibliotheca*: 8743, Alexio¹; *calciator*: 3939, Menophilus; *capsarius*: 3952, Eutactus; *praepositus cellariis*: 8747, Trophimus; *cistarius a vesteiforensi*: 5193, Anteros; *cocus*: 8753, Eros; *coelator*: 4328, Antigonus; *colorator*: 3953, Anteros; *a Corinthiis*: *CIL* X. 692, Anthus; *corporis custos*: 8804, Linus; *cubicularius*: 8781, Cissus; *decurio cubiculariorum*: 3959a, Nicodemus; *supra cubicularios*: 3954, Myrtilus; *custos rationum patrimonii*: 3926, Bromius; *dispensator*: 3970, Calamias²; *dispensator ab toris*: 8655a, Thoas; *dissignator*: 8846, Eros; *fistulator*: 4444, Eros; *fullo*: 3970b, Pothinus; *glaber ab cyatho*: 8817, Liarus; *ornator glabrorum*: 8855, Diopantius; *glutinator*: *CIL* X. 735, Stichus; *ex hortis*: 6152, Anteros; *ab imaginibus*: 3972, Syneros; *inaurator*: 3928, Philomusus; *ad insulam*: 3972, Helenus; *praepositus insulariorum*: 8855, Daphnus; *invitator*: 3975, Philippus; *lanipendus*: 3977, Blastus; *lapidarius*: 8871, Astracalus; *lecticarius*: 4349, Olympus; *lector*: 3978, Panaenus³; *lictor*: 1871, Chrestus; *a manu*: 3980, Ismarus⁴; *margaritarius*: 3981, Geleuthus; *marmorarius*: 8893, Anteros; *medicus*: 3983, Boethus⁵; *medicus ocularius*: 8909, Thyrsis; *supra medicos*: 3982, Orestes; *ensor*: 3988, Diadumenus; *ministrator*: 5351, Agathemerus; *nauarchus*: 8927, Hilarus; *nomenclator*: 5352, Admetus; *obstetrix*: 4458, Hygia; *opsonator*: 8945, Aphareus; *ab ornamentis*: 3992, Irenio; *a commentariis ornamentorum*: 8951, Chrysaor; *ab ornamentis sacerdotibus*: 8955, Cnidus; *ornatrix*: 8880, Dionysia; *ostiarius*: 3995, Amphio; *paedagogus*: 3999, Malchio; *palaestrata*: 5813, Heracla; *pedisequa*: 4003, Thamyris; *pedisequus*: 4001, Anthus; *qui praefuit pedisequis*: 33788, Diognetus; *pictor*: 4008, Heracla; *pistor*: 4010, Philadelphus; *qui praeest pistoribus*: 8998, Telesphorus; *a porticu*: 4461, Onesimus; *ad possessiones*: 4015, Hyperbolus; *praegustator*: 5355, Diadumenus; *procurator praegustatorum*: 9003, Zosimus; *procurator*: 9006, Atimetus; *procurator a regionibus urbis*: 4018, Merops; *puer de paedagogio*: 33104, Hyllus; *puerorum ornatrix*: 33099, Chloe; *a purpureis*: 4016, Parmeno; *a rationibus*: 33467, Apolaustus; *redemptor operum*: 9034, Onesimus; *sacerdos a Bona Dea*: 4003, Philematio; *a sacrario*: 4027, Aphrodisius; *sarcinatrix*: 3988, Lochias; *a sede Augustae*: 3967, Lydus; *speclariarius*: 8660, Symmachus; *praepositus speculariariorum*: 8659, Epictetus; *a statuis*: 4032, Agrypnus; *strator*: 4033, Atticus; *structor*: 4034, Parthenius; *ab supelectile*: 4035, Anteros; *sutor*: 9050, Epigonus; *symphoniaca*: 33372, Europa; *symphoniacus*: 4472, Syneros; *tabularius*: 4038, Pasicrates; *tesserarius*: 8663, Symphorus⁶; *tonsor*: 4474, Antiochus; *trichmiarchus*: 9083, Hyllus; *trierarchus*: 8928, Caspius; *ad valetudinem*: 9085, Philargyrus; *praepositus velariorum*: 9086, Strato; *ad Venerem*: 4040, Amianthes; *a veste*: 3985, Isochrysus; *a veste regia*: 8551, Corinthus; *vestiarius*: 4044, Pamphilus; *victimarius*: 4362, Castor; *vilius*: 7528, Isidorus; *unctor*: 4419, Xystus; *unctrix*: 4045, Galene.

Balliol College, Oxford

¹ Even the 'Latin library' seems to have been staffed by Greeks, cf. 5189: 'Julia Acca mater Callisthenis Ti. Caesar. Aug. a bibliotheca Latina Apollinis, et Diopithis f. eius a byblioth. Latina Apollinis.' Also 5884: 'Antiochus Ti. Claudi Caesaris a bibliotheca Latina Apollinis.'

² Another *dispensator*, Diomedes, showed cowardice when walking with Augustus, Suet., *D. Aug.* 67—a charming story.

³ cf. Cicero, *ad Att.* I. 12. 4: 'eram in scribendo turbator. nam puer festivus, anagnostes noster Sositheus, decesserat meque plus quam servi mors debere videbatur commoverat.'

⁴ These secretaries were important. Suet., *D. Aug.* 101, Polybius and Hilarion wrote Augustus' will; *ibid.* 67, a story of Thallus.

⁵ cf. Cic. *ad Att.* xv. I. 1: 'O factum male de Alexione! incredibile est quanta me molestia adfecerit, nec mehercule ex ea parte maxime, quod plerique mecum "ad quem igitur te medicum conferes?" amorem, erga me, humanitatem suavitatemque desidero.'

⁶ Apparently not a maker of mosaics but a servant who passed on orders to other servants (Boulvert, p. 34). The existence of such a position underlines the size of the household.